

LIBRORUM AESTIMATIONES

Bibliographia

FRANCISCO J. DOMÉNECH MIRA, *Catálogo de impresos de la sección de fondo antiguo del archivo y biblioteca del convento de San José, O.Carm., en Caudete, Albacete, siglos XVI y XVII*, Volumen I, PP. Carmelitas, Caudete 2001. ISBN 84-932075-1-9.

Fifty years ago, all that was known about the history of the Carmelite Order in Spain was an article by Benedict Zimmerman, O.C.D., appropriately titled *Colligite fragmenta*. Since then, a number of scholars have turned their attention to this important segment of the Order, especially Balbino Velasco, Pablo Garrido, Ismael Martínez Carretero, Rafael López Melús, and Otger Stegink, with the result that the interested reader is now thoroughly enlightened. An unanswered question still remains: How much of the Order's literary patrimony survives in the convents and public libraries (which inherited the conventual libraries)? Potentially, Carmelite culture in Spain should offer rich awards to the bibliophile and student of Carmelite history and spirituality, but the turbulent 19th and 20th centuries give one pause. This richly produced catalogue of eighty 16th and 17th century titles in the conventual library of Caudete offers one reason to be optimistic.

In the introduction, the compiler traces the history of the convent of San José from its foundation in 1578 to the present day through successive incidents of destruction in the 19th and 20th centuries. Specific references to the library in the sources are rare, but the designation of the convent as a house of formation presupposes the existence of a library for the use of the faculty and students. In a rare statistic of 1931, we learn that the library counted 4000 volumes. During the Civil War of 1936-1939, Rafael M. López-Melús, historian of the convent, conjectures, the library was distributed for safe-keeping among well-wishers of the friars.

The catalogue is concerned with the *Fundo Antigo* of the library, compiled of books from the convents in Catalonia, Aragon, Navarre or Valencia. The cataloging is carried out according to the *Descripción bibliográfica internacional normalizada para publicaciones monográficas antiguas*, 2nd ed., Madrid 1993. Entries are listed alphabetically by author, as are the works of the author. Eighty 16th and 17th century titles are described, of which thirteen are of the 16th century. The oldest work is an edition of Thomas Aquinas' *Secunda secundae*, Lyons, 1562. A page or more is dedicated to each book. First, the standard bibliographical description of the book is presented, then each detail is treated at length: title page, preliminary pieces, physical description, text, and history of the text. In most cases, a facsimile of the title page or an engrav-

ing is provided. Twenty of the eighty titles are by Carmelite authors, of which nine comprise the works of the Scripture scholar, João da Sylveira (1592-1687).

This excellent work represents volume one of the catalogue. We look forward to the promised volume two.

JOACHIM SMET, O.Carm.

Institutum Carmelitanum
Roma

MAKSIMILIJAN ZITNIK, S.I. *Sacramenta; bibliographia internationalis (continua-tio)*, vols. 5-7, Editrice Pontificia Università Gregoriana, Piazza della Pilotta 35, 00187 Roma 2002. ISBN 88-7652-914-4; 88-7652-6411-2 (opera completa). Euro 148,00.

The Jesuit scholar Maksimilian Zitnik of the Pontifical Oriental Institute will be blessed time and again by fellow scholars for his painstaking, formidable task of collecting all that has been written about the sacraments from 1900 until 2000. As in all of theology, so with the sacraments, one notes that the literature is constantly increasing. If from 1900 until 1990, the bibliography was contained in four volumes, the following decade (1991-2000) produced material which it took three volumes to cover. With changing areas of interest, it will be noted that certain topics that in the first four volumes commanded much space have either been drastically reduced or have even disappeared.

This bibliography is of such value because of its broad scope. The interdisciplinary tendency in today's theological approach is amply reinforced in the volumes under review. Some random examples will show how sacramental theology is enriched by studying its rapport with other disciplines. Of dogmatic and ecumenical interest are the entries: «Did Jesus Consider His Death to be an Atoning Sacrifice?» (49906); «Are the anathemas of the 16th century still meaningful? Do the doctrinal condemnations of the Council of Trent and of the Reformers still justify the division between our churches? Propositions submitted to the Catholic, Lutheran and Reformed Churches in Germany» (45743). Important for ecumenism are studies such as: «Liturgy and Ritual in Islamic and Judaic Traditions» (50232). History has a wealth of material yet to be discovered, as for instance: «The Theology of ordained ministry in the letters of Augustine of Hippo» (50308).

Canon Law is well represented in this collection with titles such as: «The Level of Faith with regard to the capacity of the person in the canonical evaluation of the validity of Marriage» (45794); «Affective Immaturity and lack of internal freedom as a motive for nullity of marriage» (50042). In this age of the affirmation of the role of the laity in the church, it is not surprising to find studies such as: «Participation of the laity in the Governing, Teaching and Sanctifying Office of the Church» (49741); «Year of the Family 1994» (49857). The present crises in the ministerial priesthood cannot but be represented with articles such as: «Causes for the abandonment of the Ministerial Priesthood» (49657).

The bibliography identifies the most prominent *quaestiones disputatae* of our day. The crisis of identifying sin can be intuited in such articles as: «Post-modern culture and sin: Anthropological aspects» (49525), «The Joy of Being Wrong: Original Sin through Easter Eyes» (49560). The question of the role of women can be studied from an 16th century perspective «On the nobility and excellence (*praecellentia*) of the female sex» (49386) or from the contemporary debate vantage point: «Mind your metaphors. A critique of Language in the Bishops' Pastoral Letters on the Role of Women» (49365) or «Archbishop Weakland and Cardinal O'Connor debate the Church's attitude to women» (49956). The sexual revolution has affected moral theology as evidenced by such contributions as: «Sex in utopia. An iconoclast vision of sexuality» (49387) or «To love body and soul. The Christian sense of love of the body» (49415). And the ever actual problem: «The Pastoral Problem of Divorced Persons» (49657). The thoroughness of this bibliography is evident in an entry citing the popular spiritual theology manual by Jordan Aumann and finding a chapter dedicated to the sacraments (50188).

In the last volume, the material is divided by topic and sub-headings. Just as in a library catalogue, so here, too, each entry is followed by the number of writings about the respective matter. Page after page of such numbers is a God-send for someone doing research in any area of sacramental theology. Fr. Zitnik merits the gratitude of fellow scholars and researchers for his monumental work.

REDEMPTUS MARIA VALABEK, O.Carm.

Institutum Carmelitanum
Roma

Psicologia

FRANÇOIS MARIE DERMINE. *Mistici, veggenti, e medium; esperienze dell'aldilà a confronto*, Libreria Editrice Vaticana, 00120 Città del Vaticano 2002, pp. 492. ISBN 88-209-7274-3. Euro 25,00.

La finalità dichiarata di questo libro è quella di uno studio comparato fra le esperienze con l'aldilà dei mistici, veggenti e medium cristiani con le stesse esperienze fra i non cristiani.

Nei quattro capitoli, ben articolati e adeguatamente corredati di note esplicative, l'A. parte con il dimostrare quanto siano effettivamente realistici i fenomeni di comunicazione e di manifestazione fra noi e l'aldilà, e vengono illustrate le tre ipotesi più serie: naturalistica (o paranormale); preternaturale e soprannaturale. Dopo una carrellata storico-fenomenologica si evidenziano le costanti e l'originalità di questa fenomenologia nell'ambito cristiano, biblico ed extra-biblico.

L'ultima parte, quella più interessante ma anche la più discutibile, è dedicata ai criteri di differenziazione per «distinguere in maniera più deduttiva e determinante le comunicazioni cristiane da quelle non cristiane, medianiche o meno» (p. 17).

Per l'A., nel contesto cristiano, i fenomeni analizzati si differenziano per i seguenti criteri: 1) tendono a far crescere nella fede, speranza e carità (p. 460); 2) «Gli interlocutori, mistici o profeti, non possono mai essere strumentalizzati o trasformati in automi da Dio». È sempre Dio – uno e trino – che mantiene l'iniziativa nel dare gratuitamente alcuni doni (p. 463); 3) «I fenomeni profetici cristiani non sono concepiti per catturare, abbagliare o sedurre l'essere umano, bensì per aiutarlo a mutare responsabilmente il corso della vita e degli avvenimenti sia a livello personale, sia a livello comunitario» (p. 464).

Bisogna precisare che spesso i fenomeni di comunicazione con l'aldilà vengono associati all'estasi e alla mistica, ma di fatto non è detto che debba esserci necessariamente un'implicazione reciproca di queste realtà; infatti, un mistico ordinariamente non ha delle estasi né delle comunicazioni straordinarie con l'aldilà. Bisogna anche ribadire che i cristiani che hanno questi fenomeni di «comunicazione straordinaria» non necessariamente sono dei mistici. Perciò, dal momento che il paranormale non è una garanzia di santità religiosa né di normalità psichica, la domanda cruciale è: i fenomeni paranormali di alcuni mistici cristiani sono «diversi» dagli stessi fenomeni in mistici non cristiani?

L'A. chiarisce che «La fenomenologia mistica cristiana non è protesa verso l'esperienza straordinaria fine a se stessa, ma proietta sempre il soggetto, ossia il mistico e il profeta cristiani, nonché chi li vede o chi li sente, fuori dalla propria interiorità e da se stessi; essa insiste nel rimandarli a qualcos'altro o a Qualcun altro, ossia alla realtà oggettiva di Dio» (pp. 459-460).

Si potrebbe obiettare che anche la fenomenologia mistica «non» cristiana potrebbe, analogamente, non essere protesa verso l'esperienza straordinaria fine a se stessa e potrebbe proiettare il soggetto fuori da se stesso per rimandarlo a «Qualcun altro».

L'A. ha un atteggiamento scientifico e non apologetico, ma a tratti sembra che uno stesso fenomeno paranormale venga evidenziato nei suoi aspetti positivi quando è considerato nel contesto cristiano e nei suoi aspetti negativi quando è considerato in un contesto non cristiano. Inoltre, l'A. sembra convinta che nel mistico non cristiano, la causa dei suoi fenomeni paranormali non è attribuita a Dio, ma a se stessi o al diavolo, e che il primato della conoscenza e quello dell'esperienza soggettiva contraddistinguono la fenomenologia mistica non cristiana.

Si tratta di problematiche e fenomenologie molto complesse ma, forse, la risposta può essere più semplice del previsto: è possibile che fenomeni paranormali (non spiegati dalla scienza) possano verificarsi in modo autentico non solo nel contesto della religione cristiana, ma anche in contesti di altre religioni e conservare la loro autenticità. Inoltre, la differenza fra fenomeni di comunicazione con l'aldilà in diversi contesti religiosi non dovrebbe essere ricercata nelle peculiarità epifenomeniche; ossia di ciò che appare nella dimensione psicofisiologica, ma piuttosto nei suoi contenuti. Per esempio, la trance mistica di un cristiano potrebbe avere gli stessi parametri psicofisiologici della trance mistica di un non cristiano. Se proprio vogliamo cogliere questa differenza specifica dovremmo ricercarla nella peculiarità dei suoi contenuti;

ossia, nella coerenza interna tra fenomeno e messaggio. L'epifenomenologia psicofisiologica in un mistico cristiano sarà «autentica» se si pone in continuità con una triplice coerenza di contenuti: il kerygma, il mistero pasquale e l'amore cristiano. Una visione può non essere patologica (come un'allucinazione) e compresente in più contesti religiosi, anche se non è sempre accompagnata da stigmate o da altre espressioni tipiche del vissuto di Cristo. Un qualunque fenomeno paranormale può dirsi autentico nella misura in cui fa crescere, a prescindere dallo specifico contesto religioso. La mistica cristiana non è l'unico contesto che favorisca la crescita globale.

AURELIANO PACCIOCCA, O.Carm.

Centro Internazionale Sant'Alberto
Roma

Theologia

PHILIP MELANCHTHON, *Predicazione evangelica; sermoni per le domeniche dell'anno*, Edizioni Piemme, via del Carmine 5, Casale Monferrato (AL) 2001, pp. 351. ISBN 88-384-6432-4.

For those of us who learned something vague and cursory about Philip Melanchthon in our theology course when dealing with the Protestant Reformation, this volume does what all direct reading of an author should do, namely, to give the author flesh and blood, to contextualize his writings, and to show that there is much more to the author than what is commonly listed in the manuals. The sermons are based on the Sunday Gospels, which by and large are those of the Roman Missal. This collection is just a sampling of the very erudite, magisterial and often polemical preaching of one of Martin Luther's most trusted collaborators. It would be interesting to know why these particular sermons were chosen to be printed rather than others of the author's vast repertoire. The sermons themselves have not come down to us in the author's actual writing, but rather in the transcriptions of the sermons made by his enthusiastic students.

While preserving the vivacity of the discourse as the students record the impact words that struck them, on the negative side, it also may take something away from the precision of the theologian's thought. One wonders whether his homily on Trinity Sunday was centered on the question of external or internal justification, as the text currently records, or whether he did give some explicit teaching on the Trinity, on which truth there was convergence with the Catholic position.

Melanchthon's erudition shines through his knowledge of history, even before Christian times, as he quotes easily from the classical authors. He deals with Greek and Latin with the same ease as his native German. He is constantly explaining the etymology of Greek and Latin phrases and words. For instance, he points out that for the Romans humility was not a virtue; modesty was. Humility was considered, following his picturesque expression, as «the

devil's toilet paper». But he is also very much immersed in the concrete, as he notes that much about the Christian faith he picked up from his father and uncle. On the question of prayer, he notes how well his small daughter prays in her simple way. Admittedly, he often gets off the point, even in the midst of a very erudite discourse, if he sees a pastoral opportunity to help his listeners understand the truth concretely lived. He insists that a fervent Christian should recite the Creed three times a day. This especially in contrast with the Catholic penchant for unbiblical devotions as those honoring the saints and the Blessed Mother, which he sees as idolatry pure and simple.

Some scholars have opined that the Reformation would not have happened in its present form of division into many Christian church groupings, had Melanchthon's theology prevailed. In fact, within the Lutheran confession, whose leader he became after Luther's death, he was accused of being both a pro-Catholic and a crypto-Calvinist. He was the Lutheran voice in many of the innumerable efforts to resolve the theological differences between the warring trends within the Christian fabric. While he is unsparing in his condemnation of the idolatry that he finds in the Roman Catholic approach, he readily admits that the Lutherans are no better. In fact, he is chagrined at the divisions within the Lutheran movement; the consequent suffering may have hastened his death in 1560. The realization that the Church is not made up of saints but of sinners, made him viscerally opposed to the Anabaptists, who wished to establish «a city of saints» in Munster in 1534-1535, especially when they used violence in order to get their way. In this sense, he condemns those who take one point of Church teaching and neglect the whole: he was wary of mystical movements which tended to be elitist

Melanchthon brags that once in a discussion with an imperial Catholic preacher, he almost brought the latter to his Protestant viewpoint on the trustful faith in Christ Jesus that one needs for justification. Congenial to Catholics will be his dogged defense of the intellectual process in the act of faith. He makes constant reference to his listeners, young men preparing for Church ministry. Surprisingly, given his condemnation of veneration of saints, he proposes St. Christopher to them as a model. The child the Saint carries on his shoulders is an apt image of the minister's task to bring the Word to others through thick and thin. Though he warns that he is not speaking in the «papist» sense, still he is adamant in affirming the «external/institutional» aspect of the Church together with the «spiritual/mystical» aspect. Again, close to the Catholic position, he accepts the power of those in Holy Orders as well as the power of jurisdiction. He speaks much of the «ecclesiastical ministry» which God himself established in order to offer us eternal benefits through this ministry. With Luther, and against the early Osiander, Melanchthon affirms the legitimacy of private confession. While he points out that the words *Bus*, *poenitentia*, *metanoia* are inadequate to express «the real conversion» that the Gospel demands, still he wishes to avoid polemics and so will go along with the word «penitence». He rejects the contention of those who exclude good works from the faith. One can see why Melanchthon would have been chosen often to represent the Protestant part in attempts to heal the breach between Catholicism and the Reformers; he agrees with the former on many points.

But one must not idealize. Melanchthon minces no words in his condemnation of Catholic abuse. He is not at all ecumenical in dealing with the «papists» as he invariably calls Catholics and not in any positive sense. For him, they are simple idolaters. And he is very concrete in what he means: «An idol is the adoration of the bread (Eucharist), carried here and there, since sacraments of rites are only such at the moment they are celebrated and not outside that time». The monastic habit and monastic life itself are idols. Monks have subverted the pure faith of the Gospels. The Popes are in evident contrast with the truth when they maintain idols, such as the invocation of the dead at Mass, «the sacrilegious Mass, and immodest celibacy, weighed down with many, damnable enough evils» (p. 348). The prayers that Catholics pour out at the statues of saints and even of Mary, are pure idolatry.

«How many persons make use of religion wrongly for other purposes. The Pope cites religion as a pretext of his temporal power, yet he remains a minister of the Gospel. He wants kings to prostrate before him. But Christ is crowned with thorns by the persons who wish to win kingdoms» (p. 329). The many references throughout these sermons to the abuse of the Pope's temporal power underscores the abomination which Protestants saw in the papal claims. For them it was a painful and illegitimate usurping of earthly power by someone who «should not mix in with those stupid disputes about kingdoms and empires, which the Papists mix with (p. 234) and in so doing are from the part of the devil». The Papists «are to be considered absolutely as enemies of God and of the Church; they are excommunicated» (p. 117).

Imposed celibacy, which Melanchthon considers as *contra naturam*, is seen as a Papal ruse to avoid Church properties falling into the hands of a priest's heirs. One can understand how Catholics would bristle and attack such caricatures of their faith as: «the base form of idolatry that Papists call the Mass» (p.163), which is celebrated merely for monetary gain. He is not sparing of those Spaniards who while celebrating the Passion of Christ beat themselves bloody, but otherwise are worthless robbers, adulterers (he does admit that his Church has some of the same ilk). In the same category he puts priests who celebrate Mass once a day but for the rest of the time are women-chasers, lascivious adulterers, full of vices.

This interesting collection of sermons, which were so important in the Protestant rationale, transports one back to the tumultuous times of the beginnings of the Reformation. While our more sophisticated times would avoid many of the epithets which were then generously hurled at one's adversaries, still the underlying theological differences and misunderstandings must be faced in any kind of fruitful ecumenical dialogue. The fact that the language of these sermons being so polemical, is anachronistic, is a hopeful sign of our times. But the volume is also a reminder that convictions about Gospel values run deep in the human spirit and must be recognized in order to achieve any kind of unity.

REDEMPTUS VALABEK, O.Carm.

Institutum Carmelitanum
Roma

Mariologia

RENZO BERTALOT, *Ecco la serva del Signore, una voce protestante*, (Scripta Pontificiae Facultatis Theologicae Marianum, 56, Nova series 28). Edizioni Marianum, Viale Trenta Aprile 6, 00153 Roma 2002, pp. 168. ISBN 88-87016-60-7.

Over thirty years a member of the Marianum faculty in Rome, the Waldensian theologian Renzo Bertalot offers «a Protestant voice» in this interesting volume of thirteen reworked essays, dating from 1981 and identified as to occasions first delivered. There is inevitable but tolerable repetition, endemic to such collections. An «appendix» «Stabat Mater» is the text of a program presented at the Roman church of S.Maria Cabrini, January 23, 2001. Salvatore M Perrella, O.S.M., Bertalot's colleague at the Marianum, continues the ecumenical interchange with the *postfazione* (139-161) «La Madre del Signore, Icona del credente e della chiesa», highlighted by the phrase *dialogare per non morire* of Jean Marie Roger Tillard, O.P. (1927-2000) of France and Canada.

Much about this book is pleasing, beginning with the color cover reproduction of the Annunciation scene from the Vatican chapel *Redemptoris Mater*. It opens with two testimonials: one from I. Calabuig, O.S.M., head of Marianum, the other from Ermanno E. Genre of the Roman Waldensian faculty. The first chapter, *I Protestanti*, is an excellent overview reprinted from the 1985 *Nuovo Dizionario de Mariologia*. For this volume, Bertalot's introduction explains the coming chapters. Two are on the Magnificat, based on Luther's commentary. Chapters on the Immaculate Conception and the Assumption spell out Protestant difficulties and differences, patiently and courteously. In a country so strongly Catholic, the chapter on Protestantism in Italy is instructive. *Israele-Maria-Chiesa* is dependent on K.Barth. Under the aegis of «ecumenism» are such essays as *Mary and the Holy Spirit*, and «Six Little Theses on Dialogue and Mary» (taking note of *Dominus Jesus*).

Overall? Nearly half a century ago, this reviewer had occasion to publish in «The American Ecclesiastical Review» 135 (December 1956), the article *A Waldensian View on the Virgin Mary*, an analysis of a 1950 "critical essay in the history of dogma", to use its original Italian subtitle, which appeared in a poor English translation in 1956 by the Presbyterian Westminster Press of Philadelphia as *The Virgin Mary: the Roman Catholic Marian Doctrine* (in 1955 from Lutterworth of London and Ryerson of Canada). G. Miegge was a prominent Waldensian pastor and professor, several times cited by Bertalot.

Bertalot is au courant with contemporary writings of ecumenical import, as the Dombes document *Mary in the Plan of God* and in the *Communion of Saints, Ut unum sint*, the Lutheran-Roman Catholic agreement on justification of 1999, etc. An encouraging aspect of Bertalot's considerations is the stress on shared central Christian truths, especially that holy Virgin Mary is the Mother of God. Where differences still obtain, e.g., the question of merit, the nature of a possible Marian «intercession», dissenting views are stated clearly without giving offense to the Catholic side. The ecumenical horizon has brightened considerably since the early fifties. Bertalot's papers offer a refreshing change

from the tonality of the English translation of the Miegge book of the fifties, a judgemental overview compounded by the bad translation from Italian, and including in the American edition a foreword by Princeton's John A. Mackay, accusing the Catholic church of substituting Mary for Christ, even as Mackay and Miegge and very strongly Bertalot say: «Let Mary continue to be "blessed among women", the greatest and most honored woman who ever lived».

EAMON R. CARROLL, O.Carm.

*International Marian Research Institute
University of Dayton
Dayton, Ohio*

Vita Spiritualis

AA.VV., *Mistica e Mistica Carmelitana* (Collana «Studi Carmelitani» 2, diretta da L. Borriello, OCD), Libreria Editrice Vaticana, 00120 Citta` del Vaticano 2002, pp. 321. ISBN 88-209-7247-6. Euro 18,00.

How often our days have been labeled materialistic, hedonistic, consumistic. Yet the mystical phenomenon, practically on the opposite end of the value system, surprisingly also is the object of much interest. The Carmelite Order has been known for outstanding exemplars of members who not only had the mystical experience, but also recognized and those who were given the added grace of being able to describe it. No wonder, then, that the second of a projected series, «Carmelite Studies», directed by indefatigable Discalced Luigi Borriello, issued by the Vatican press, is dedicated to an up-to-date study of mysticism especially with a Carmelite tonality.

The collection of essays by experts is opened by the foremost scholar on St. John of the Cross, Federico Ruiz, who masterfully outlines the *Sitz im Leben* of the mystic question. The volume would be worth acquiring just for this first chapter which stresses both the ontological and the psychological dimensions of the phenomenon. Mysticism is not experienced in a vacuum: it is rooted in salvation history, highlighted in the Person of Christ Jesus, based on Sacred Scripture, celebrated in the sacraments within a concrete ecclesial community, a mediated experience, then, which is a development of the project of a normal Christian life. How wise the observation: mystic graces are not essential for holiness, charity is. Such insights give the assurance of a master's hand, and these insights abound. It is a mistake, Fr. Ruiz points out, to identify mysticism with moments of fervor and not moments of poverty, coldness, conflict situations, sickness, dryness, darkness, unexpected situations, the absence of God.

Useful studies concentrate on the language of the mystics (L. Borriello), on mystical symbolism (G. Castro Martinez) and on psychological implications of the experiences of St. Teresa of Jesus, John of the Cross (L.J. Gonzalez). M. de Groedt interestingly compares Carmelite Teresian mysticism with that of Simone Weil, Ety Hillesum and the Charismatic Renewal Movement. The

specification of «Carmelite - Teresian» is a salutary relief when compared to some other statements in this volume.

There is a chapter on pre-Teresian mysticism in Carmel by, a chapter which contains many fine insights and even information about the recent discovery of sermons of Conrad of St. George of Cologne (fl. 1290-1317), which are found in a collection with sermons of John Ruusbroec and Thomas a Kempis. His mysticism centers on the Eucharist, for which he found many foreshadowings in the Old Testament of God's initiatives in the transformation which true mysticism causes in those who celebrate the daily Eucharist fittingly. The sermons of Henry of Hanna († 1299) again in a collection of other mystical authors, confirms that in their first century of existence Carmelites were already fully committed to the medieval mystical movement.

How is it, then, that in the following chapter one reads that the Carmelite mystic school started with St. Teresa and St. John of the Cross? How long will statements like «St. Theresa of Jesus and St. John of the Cross are the origin (!) of the Carmelite school» (p. 73), be printed in learned texts without hints that both Carmelite giants loved Carmel so much that they wished to bring it back to its original freshness and effectiveness? Already in the bibliography prepared by Edmund Caruana there is evidence of pre-Teresian mysticism in Carmel, and more could be adduced. It would seem that studies of Pablo Garrido, O.Carm. on figures such as Juan Sanz, Jaime Montanes, Miguel de la Fuente, plus various figures of the Touraine Reform have nothing to do with Carmel's mysticism. Some, not all, authors put Miguel de la Fuente on a par with St. Theresa and St. John of the Cross.

Just to cite one example from this volume: much of the symbolism of Carmel's first two Doctors of the Church described effectively, is found in previous Carmelite authors. It was the Chapter of Montpellier of 1287 that identified Carmel as «*arx contemplationis*». H. Blommestijn dedicates much of his article to the *Fiery Arrow* of Nicholas the Frenchman. A serious study could be made of the symbolism in this text, a desperate cry for Carmelite authenticity in the first century of the Order's existence. Though cited in the bibliography, no attention is paid to E. Boaga's *Dal secolo XII al secolo XVI: La teologia spirituale Carmelitana pre-Teresiana*. If the volume purports to cover «Carmelite» mysticism, it is a serious defect to have left out some attention to figures like St. Mary Magdalene de' Pazzi or Ven. John of St. Samson, whom Jacques Maritain once called he French St. John of the Cross.

In his treatment of the *Fiery Arrow*, H. Blommestijn is of the opinion that the author is not much interested in the physical *situs* or *terra*, but rather in the psychological conditions necessary for union with God. Though this interpretation may have its merits, it fails to appreciate the original Carmelites' love for their birthplace on Mt. Carmel, for which they showed great nostalgia. The medieval mentality put much store in the physical; in the Rule was stressed the importance of the physical make-up of the hermitage, much in the spirit of the Crusades which were undertaken out of the sense of Christian shame that the land which had soaked up the redeeming Blood of Christ Jesus should be in the hands of unbelievers. It is also too apodictic to say that the *Fiery Arrow* does not describe the historical tension within the newly founded Order; in fact, this

valuable document has not been valued sufficiently because of so much negativism vis-à-vis Carmelite friars who wish to keep up with the other mendicants without being prepared, because of their eremitical origins. The same thing can be noted in the citation of the *Rubrica prima*: although there is a definite spiritual explanation of the Carmelite vocation, no need to apologize or deny that at that time the Carmelites did believe, as the citation cited explicitly states, that there was a succession of religious who lived on Carmel from the time of the prophets Elias and Eliseus. It is too easy, or anachronistic, to impose our critical historical criteria on an age that judged things differently.

The final chapter, «From Buddhism to Christianity», makes for interesting reading, but seems to be out of place in this volume which is of a much more specific nature. Conversion stories are witnesses to the marvels of God's grace, but often are collected under one cover.

These latter critical remarks do not mean to take away an iota from the fine writing on Carmelite mysticism contained in this volume. The individuating characteristic of the Carmelite tonality is ably described by several of the contributors. The primacy of God's initiative is beautifully stressed. Freedom, as a fruit of union with God, is amply dealt with. The need for Church approval underscores the need for both the institutional and charismatic in the Church. Interestingly, St. Theresa is quoted as assuring her sisters that they can reach the heights not for enjoyment, but for service. Activity is part of the mystic's ideal, as the 25,000 kms. travelled by John of the Cross and his external work in Grenada between 1582 and 1588 attest. The volume succeeds in presenting «a Carmelite dialect within the language of the Church» (p. 216).

REDEMPTUS MARIA VALABEK, O.Carm.

Institutum Carmelitanum
Roma

JUAN DE BONO, *Elisabetta della Trinita. Il perché della sofferenza*, Libreria Editrice Vaticana, 00120 Citta del Vaticano 2002, pp. 262. ISBN 88-209-7254-9. Euro 17,00.

Prayer and sacrifice used to be staples of a serious spiritual life. These latter times, with much stress on the incarnational and resurrection dimensions, have obscured the role of sacrifice and suffering. Since these latter are never lacking in a person's life, and since their meaning in the striving for holiness has been obfuscated, many a sincere seeker of holiness has lost his/her way.

To someone brought up on contemporary, positive-thinking spirituality, a statement such as the following by Bl. Elizabeth of the Trinity will appear abnormal: «The good God has never allowed me to understand as I do now that sorrow is the greatest guarantee of love which He can grant to a creature. The sign by which we know that God is with us and that his love has taken possession of us is that of accepting what wounds us and which makes us suffer, not only with patience but even with gratitude». The young Discalced Carmelite friar from Malta, Juan de Bono, has undertaken the task of explaining how this

conviction is at the heart of Bl. Elizabeth's spiritual odyssey. Much like St. Therese of Lisieux, whose writings Elisabeth knew, the latter would not recognize a spiritual way that did not integrate suffering – suffering gladly accepted and even sought after – as essential to the spiritual life. Both Carmelite giants saw Jesus redeem the human race by the cross, epitomizing his self-oblation to the Father; both understood that Jesus was too good and great to reserve this work to himself. He wished to include his members, inviting them to collaborate with Him in the redemption of their contemporaries and so they should expect to follow Jesus on the way of the cross.

The circumstances of Elizabeth's birth were a foreshadowing of her share in Christ's suffering. Her mother, Marie, suffered through a difficult pregnancy to the extent that the doctors warned that the baby might well be stillborn. The father rushed to the parish priest who was vesting for Mass, and begged him to offer Mass for the safe delivery of his child. The priest agreed, and, in fact, Elizabeth was born while the Mass was being celebrated. Until her first Holy Communion, Elizabeth was not an exemplary youngster. In fact, she was so headstrong and self-centered that at a certain point her mother threatened to gather her clothing and hand her over to the reform school run by the Good Shepherd sisters nearby. Elizabeth became an accomplished pianist, winning several competitions for her renditions of Chopin, Liszt and Schumann. She sang in the parish choir; and loved pantomimes and dancing. The Paris World's Fair enthused her. She was good company; she once missed her train because she was happy to help her companions load their suitcases. She taught catechism sometimes to forty children.

Elizabeth's efforts to overcome her faults were especially noted between her first confession (in 1887, when she was six and a half) and her first Communion (in 1891, when she was eleven). Her strong, uncontrolled character became docile and ever more recollected. Carmel attracted her at a young age, yet when her mother was categorical in refusing to give her permission to enter and forbade Elizabeth to visit the cloister, she obeyed, with a single exception, until 1899, when her mother reluctantly gave her permission. No sulking on Elizabeth's part, she continued to cultivate her talents and interests. She knew this would please her cultured mother. Two deeply felt tragedies for sensitive Elizabeth were the deaths of her grandfather and father, one soon after the other.

Once in Carmel, Elizabeth found her suffering, as is usual, not so much in extraordinary penances, as in the daily «pinpricks» of everyday living. At that particular time, the anti-Catholic French government was closing monastery after monastery. The danger to the Dijon monastery was so great that the superior had to visit possible venues of refuge in Belgium and Switzerland. During the period when her mother refused permission to enter Carmel, Elizabeth had had doubts about her vocation; now as the prospect of being exiled grew, Elizabeth was assailed by doubts that her mother would be able to survive her exile, and so she said she would stay with her mother if the nuns were expelled. Several of the sisters in community did not understand Elizabeth, causing her much suffering. The subprioress was not happy with Elizabeth's mistakes in choir and often chastised her. Nor was she pleased with Eliz-

abeth's apparent carelessness when she served as portress. Often she would mix up messages or forget to communicate them. In the dining room, another sister took exception to Elizabeth's recollected ways; when she finished eating she would usually lower her eyes in recollection. Her critical sisters wondered why she was not more interested in helping others in cleaning up. Sr. Genevieve of the Trinity was convinced that the Prioress, Mother Germaine, was babying Elizabeth. As a result the superior spoke little of Elizabeth and often reproved her. This could not but hurt Elizabeth who received most support and affection from the superior.

It which was amazing was that Elizabeth, fiery, hypersensitive, «devilish» in her youth, became the epitome of pleasantness, a pleasantness that turned into strength of will, especially when in 1905 she was diagnosed as afflicted with Addison's disease, which at that time was incurable. Her physical pain was so aggravated that the thought of suicide passed through her mind. Once when the superior was leaving the infirmary, Elizabeth called out: «How can you leave someone who is suffering so much?» On another occasion: «A person could come to believe that God does not exist». But even at these low points of her life, she was convinced «God strikes us only because he loves us».

The author does well to show the sufferings of Elizabeth in the context of her share in the paschal mystery of Christ, which every follower of the Lord must experience. Again, he gives example after example in concrete instances of how Elizabeth repeated in her own earthly existence the various stages of Christ's redeeming work.

Another interesting chapter is devoted to Elizabeth as «the Carmelite of St. Paul». It has often been noted that the injunction of the Carmelite rule to follow St. Paul in order not to go astray, has not been particularly followed by Carmelites. Bl. Elizabeth of the Trinity is one Carmelite who delved deeply into St. Paul and saw her own experience expressed in an inspired way by the Apostle of the Gentiles.

Another highlight of this volume is the description of Bl. Elizabeth's progress in the Spirit following the stages of St. John of the Cross. Though here and there a bit more suppleness would have helped, by and large the author chronicles the purification of the dark nights in Elizabeth's following of St. John's ample teaching. Interestingly, the much esteemed Fr. Vallee, O.P., who guided Elizabeth well on the spiritual path, did not understand the suffering aspect; fortunately a Jesuit, Fr. Vergne, was an able mentor on this point.

A few minor points on what might have enhanced the value of the volume still more. Most of Elizabeth's writings were written not for religious, but for lay people. And Elizabeth had no qualms in maintaining her love not only for her mother, sister, and the latter's family, but also for the many friends she had had in the world. She firmly believed that in prayer she was lovingly united to her loved ones. How many times wrote to a priest: we shall be united as we pray the Hour of Terce tomorrow. Elizabeth's mysticism is rooted in the concrete realities of her day-to-day existence. Though it may be a *quaestio disputata*, on page 138 it would be more ecumenical to refer to St. John of the Cross as a reformer rather than the founder of Carmel.

The volume is an excellent first-fruits which hopefully will become the author's speciality. The anti-Catholic ambiance, the position of Dijon's Bishop vis-a-vis the Vatican, the contextualization of Elizabeth's earthly existence all inspire confidence in the competence of the author. The book is an authentic contribution to the studies on Bl. Elizabeth of the Trinity and on the important question of suffering/the cross/sacrifice in contemporary spiritual theology.

REDEMPUS MARIA VALABEK, O.Carm.

Institutum Carmelitanum
Roma

NICOLAS LE FRANÇAIS, *La flèche de feu*, texte latin et traduction français (Flèche de feu, 3) Abbaye de Bellefontaine, 49122 Bégrolles en Mauges 2000, pp. 171. ISBN 2-85589-803-X.

Nicholas of France was prior general of the Carmelite Order probably from 1265 until his retirement in 1271. How long he lived thereafter is not known. Since Pope Innocent IV's mitigation of the rule in 1247, the Carmelites were permitted to make foundations in places other than deserts. The former type of foundation eventually prevailed, and Nicholas on his visitation of the Order found the Carmelites with apostolic approbation absorbed in pastoral work. In this letter, which he called «the fiery arrow», he paints a very negative picture of the Order and calls on his subjects to return to the eremitical life in the desert. This edition for the first time makes the complete text, first edited by Adrianus Staring, available in the French language. This edition, too, is notable for its introduction (which occupies almost half the book) by Fr. Carlo Cicconetti, author of a masterful work on the Carmelite rule (1973).

As he did for the Rule, Fr. Cicconetti submits the text to an examination in terms of the society which produced it. In separate sections, he treats the author's use of scripture (the famous four-fold senses of scripture) and of medieval theology and spirituality of religious life.

The central theme of Nicholas' letter - the obligation to live in the desert - leads Fr. Cicconetti to deal in considerable detail with the mitigated rule of Innocent IV of 1247. He has already treated this matter in his work on the Rule. His thesis is that Innocent's Rule changed the Order from an eremitical institute to a Mendicant Order. Here, he especially examines the pope's letter, *Paganorum incursum*, of July 27, 1246, previous to the mitigation, in which the pope declares that the Carmelites wish to attain a state in which they can be of use both to themselves and their neighbor (*statum consequi valeant in quo sibi et proximis... ad salutem proficere hilariscant*). Fr. Cicconetti adduces many examples to show that the state of being useful to the neighbor besides the self implies the care of souls. Hence, the Carmelites had already decided to undertake this style of life. Yet it seems odd that the pope should announce the Carmelites' important decision to change their status as a sort of *obiter dictum* in an otherwise routine letter of protection: an announcement, moreover, that

would hardly be welcome to the bishops whose favor is requested. Perhaps the advantage to neighbor in this case is that suggested by Nicholas himself in his plea for the eremitical life: the edification of the faithful by the devout life of the hermits.

Attempting to solve the conundrums of history by hermeneutics alone has its limitations. The Romans had a name for history: *res gestae*, things done, events. It is true that the traditional structure of medieval society assigned to monks prayer in remote areas and to clergy the care of souls in the city, but the times had changed. The popular and proliferating Mendicants had accustomed the faithful to the sight of religious in the cities, where they usurped the duties of the clergy. The Second Council of Lyons (1274) did not banish the Mendicants to rural areas, but sought to reduce their number. In the revered and model Holy Land, foundations in the open countryside were impracticable and sometimes fatal. The 13th century Flemish mystic, Hadewych, tells of hermits living in Jerusalem. Hermits lived in the walls of that city. The *paganorum incursus* drove the hermits of Mount Carmel not only to Europe, but also into the cities of Acre and Tyre.

Fr. Cicconetti does not comment on Nicolas' style. To this reader it was, except for certain eloquent poetic passages, repetitious and rather more murky than the usual medieval Latin. The translators have produced a lucid and eminently readable text.

JOACHIM SMET, O.Carm.

Institutum Carmelitanum
Roma

LYN M. SCHEURING, *Paradox of Poverty: Francis of Assisi and John of the Cross* (Studies in Franciscanism), Franciscan Press, Quincy University, 1800 College Ave., Quincy, Illinois 62301, Quincy Ill. 2001. ISBN 0-8199-0994-7.

Studies in contrasts are enlightening. Comparing the attitudes on poverty of two Catholic giants not only etches the image of the two Saints more exactly, but also brings out different dimensions of Catholicism's approach to poverty. In the worldly sense, poverty is a negative, something to be eliminated as a scourge, something demeaning of human dignity. Paradoxically, on a spiritual, supernatural level that same poverty becomes a virtue. This study argues cogently that for the Catholic, especially for a more intensely committed Catholic, poverty is an essential of the Gospel-inspired life.

Though nuanced, following the characteristics of St. Francis and St. John, still poverty takes on positive meaning only if centered on the Person of Jesus Christ. For both Saints, holiness bespeaks an ever growing attention and love for the Lord Jesus. It means refusing to let any creature be an obstacle to the overwhelming love that is poured forth on us by the Spirit of Jesus. For both saints, the striving after perfection entails more and more dependence on the Lord and his work in us; it requires a giving of more and more space to Jesus.

St. Francis' poverty, epitomized in various external gestures, is studied through the theological analysis of St. Bonaventure, and means to leave aside all human accretions and follow the «nude» Christ. While St. Francis appreciated creatures as shot through and through with traces of their divine Creator, still they are relative, as St. Francis showed in a radical way. He appeared before the local bishop and divested himself as a symbol of the riches and prestige of his paternal heritage, which he wished to forego, in order to become a follower of the Poor Christ. A second episode was Francis' meeting with the lepers whose mere sight was most abhorrent to him, yet he was enabled to recognize in them «the least» of Jesus' members and so he embraced and served them even with joy. This encounter with «the least, *minores*» led St. Francis to make a preferential option for them and for service of them. The rest of his earthly life Francis spent guiding his companion friars «minor» to be faithful to this option. His greatest suffering was to see even exemplary friars deviate from the ideal. Finally, St. Francis' poverty comes to a climax at La Verna, where Francis so identifies with the poor and suffering Christ that he is graced with even the physical share in the stigmata of his Master.

St. John of the Cross, on the other hand, was born into poverty. His father had been disinherited by his comfortable artisan family when he married below his status. The mother, Catalina, was left a widow with three young boys to care for. There was so little to eat that the middle son, Luis, died of malnutrition. When the valiant woman undertook an arduous trip on foot with her sons in order to beg help of her wealthy in-laws, the door was shut in her face, even by several ecclesiastics. She was able to place John in a school for boys of poor families. Rather than souring the young John on life, this destitution and misery became the touchstone of his non pareil dependence on God. In later life, he kept on repeating *nada* to all creatures, not in an obscurantist sense, but rather with the meaning that when compared with the immensity of the goodness of God, everything else appears as nothing. St. John's poverty, then, took on a deeply mystic sense, but as with the Poverello of Assisi, it was an incarnate poverty. With the reform of Carmel, St. Teresa of Jesus visited the ramshackle «house» of the first friars in Duruelo. Teresa, seeing that when it snowed, the unrepaired roof allowed snow and rain to fall on the heads of the friars assembled in choir, declared that the place was not fit for human habitation, even of the most saintly of persons. Yet it was in such conditions that the reform began, and John intuited that it was the way in which reform was possible. He had proof of the authenticity of this insight when he was imprisoned in Toledo. Deprived of everything, including the sacraments (the Prior would not give permission to John to celebrate Mass not even on the solemnity of the Assumption of Our Lady), John found the All. In the degradation of all human values, St. John realized the sublime experience of «the one pearl of great price», for which one is willing to give up everything else. He realized that he had been emptied in order to be filled – filled with the ocean of divine Love. So he was enabled to write some of the most sublime mystical poetry in the Catholic tradition. But before his death, St. John had still to be emptied. Like St. Francis before him, so John had to suffer from fellow reformers who did

not share his vision. In fact, one superior said that if he had his way, John would be dismissed from the Reform, or else sent to the Mexican missions. Embracing poverty until the end, as he lay dying he asked the local prior, who did not like St. John, whether he would grant him to die and be buried in the Carmelite habit.

Both outstanding Christians, Francis and John, were reformers, wishing to reestablish the purity and simplicity of Gospel living, which they saw to be centered on the Person of the Incarnate Word. For them poverty was a positive element because it enabled them to avoid the many obstacles and pitfalls that creatures pose. Only too often God's beautiful creation, rather than leading us to the «one thing necessary», becomes an end in itself. While both show a marvelous osmosis of external and internal poverty, it is true that Francis' external manifestations are particularly meaningful, while in St. John's case the interior «nakedness» needed for holiness becomes a touchstone of spiritual progress.

The author adds an abundant and well chosen bibliography. Some repetitions are inevitable, but on occasion the reader is left with a too vivid *déjà vu* reaction. The authors cited within the text are often most useful for discovering the riches of the poverty of the two saints. It would have been even better if citations could have been made of primary sources, rather than citing these latter only through secondary sources. However, this compact volume will be a welcome addition to both Franciscan and Carmelite literature, showing the absolute need of poverty and its many forms and expressions, for any serious following of Jesus Christ.

REDEMPUS MARIA VALABEK, O.Carm.

Institutum Carmelitanum
Roma

WILFRIED STINISSEN, O.C.D., *Elke dag is de dag van God; gedachten voor elke dag van het jaar*, Carmelitana, Burgstraat 46, 9000 Gent 2000, pp. 386. ISBN 90-76671-25-7.

The author of this book is a Belgian Discalced Carmelite living in a contemplative community in Sweden. To this writer's knowledge, he is the author of at least a score of spiritual works, some of them in Swedish. These meditations are taken from conferences and sermons dating from the years, 1969-1993.

The title of the book, «Each day is God's day; thoughts for each day of the year», indicates its content and structure. Each page of the book contains a meditation, none longer than a page. In this way, the author hopes to adjust daily meditation to the frenetic modern schedule. The book loosely follows the Church year: February 20-March 31 relate to Lent; April 1-May 20 to Easter, Ascension, and Pentecost; November to death and eschatology; December to Advent and Christmas, but it is not a book of meditations on the liturgical readings of the day.

The style is informal, appealing. The book abounds in fresh spiritual insights and wisdom, evidence of the author's long experience of the interior life. In Carmelite literature, it is the best thing of its kind since such meditation manuals as Pius aan de Stegge's and Gabriel of St. Mary Magdalen's. It should be translated into English and other more available languages.

JOACHIM SMET, O.Carm.

Institutum Carmelitanum
Roma

Historia

Encyclopedia of Monasticism, editor WILLIAM M. JOHNSTON, photo-editor CLAIRE RENKIN, Fitzroy Dearborn, Chicago & London 2000, 2 vols., I: pp. xvii + 1-798; II: pp.: ix + 799-1556. ISBN 1-57958-090-4. Price £ 160.

The sheer size of this encyclopedia is somewhat intimidating, two heavy volumes which are enough to weigh down the strongest shelves. However, as a reference work for anyone studying the various forms of religious life throughout the world, it is of inestimable value. Unlike earlier encyclopedias which deal only with Christian forms of religious life, the *Encyclopedia of Monasticism* seeks to be comprehensive and includes articles of forms of religious life in other religions, especially Buddhism. At times, this leads to a series of parallel articles, for example «Ascetism: Buddhist Perspectives» is followed by «Ascetism: Christian Perspectives», and this happens for many other topics. Certainly the coverage of the work is impressive and the list of scholars who worked on the project is extensive, containing 21 advisers and around 280 contributors from all over the world. The editor William Johnston deserves to be credited for bringing together such a pool of talent and for systematising their contributions into a unified publication. Each of the contributions follows a consistent pattern with a bibliography and list of related articles at the end. Reflecting the changing methods of study, many of the bibliographies include appropriate website addresses.

A review such as this could go on indefinitely looking at different themes but, perhaps, it is best to concentrate on those entries which are most relevant for Carmelite readers. Fr. Patrick McMahon, O.Carm., has contributed the article «Carmelites: Female» (pp. 240-242) and his essay gives a good concise description of the emergence of the female branch of the Carmelite Order, formally approved in 1452 and then revitalised under the Teresian reform. The companion article entitled «Carmelites: Male» is written by Keith Egan (pp. 242-243). Dr. Egan is well-known to Carmelite scholars and his article gives a brief comprehensive history of the Order. The bibliographies are brief but helpful although they would have benefited from details of a few of the many websites created by Carmelites throughout the world. Such sites are full of useful information. The third major branch of the Carmelite Order, the

Carmelites of Mary Immaculate, who number of 2000 friars do not get an article on their own but are given a brief reference of four lines in the article on «India: Christian» (p. 640).

Patrick McMahon also contributes an article «Theology, Western Church: Carmelite» (pp. 1261-1262). This is an excellent brief overview of Carmelite theological writings during the Order's history and covers the contributions by a number of major figures, John Baconthorpe, Gerard of Bologna, Thomas Netter, etc. This is the sort of article which could be valuable for Carmelite students. As expected, the major Carmelite saints are given substantial articles, e.g. «John of the Cross» by Elisabeth Teresa Howe (pp. 701-702), «Teresa of Avila» by Thomas Dandelet (pp. 1242-1244) and «Thérèse of Lisieux» by Keith Egan (pp. 1268-1270). The article by Thomas Dandelet is comprehensive on the life of St. Teresa and features a helpful annotated bibliography. However his brief account of the controversy over the introduction of the new *Constitutions* for the nuns is a little simplistic. There were, in fact, extensive consultations of the opinions of the nuns and it was not simply an attempt by the «Church hierarchy ... to impose a new *Constitution*» (p. 1244). Also he seems to be unaware of the letter issued in support of the group of traditionalist Carmels by Pope John Paul II which was published without any consultation with the Discalced Carmelite General Curia.

The Carmelites receive passing references in a few more general articles. The Carmelite nun and miniaturist, Cornelia van Wulschkerche, receives a laudatory mention in the article «Visual Arts, Western Christian: Book Arts before the Renaissance» (pp. 1374-1376). Similarly, Filippo Lippi is mentioned in the article «Visual Arts, Western Christian: Painting» (pp. 1379-1380); surprising he is said to have joined the Franciscans (!) in Florence. Also although described as «Among the most famous monastic artists...», he receives no mention in the bibliography. In this respect, the excellent work by Megan Holmes was probably published too late for inclusion. Also, there are illustrations which are of special Carmelite interest, such as the pictures of the cloister of the Carmelite convent in Parma, Italy (p. 398), the garden of the Discalced Carmelite convent of St. Joseph-des-Carmes, Paris (p. 397), whilst there is a photo of the Bernini statue of Virgin and Child from the church of the same convent on page 243. Other illustrations occur is specifically Carmelite entries.

Strangely, there is little reference to Elijah as an exemplar for monastic life and the reference to Elijah and Elisha in the article «Biblical figures and practices» (p. 153-154) is more concerned with the phenomena associated with the «sons of the prophets». After the studies of Élianne Poirot, O.C.D. on the patristic sources, one would have expected a more substantial entry. Also, somewhat unexpectedly in view of the widespread devotion during the centuries, the Carmelite scapular is omitted completely from the article on «Clothing: Christian perspectives» (pp. 309-310) and is limited to a brief mention in Patrick McMahon's article on the Order.

Finally, in order to complete the survey of Carmelite involvement, the present reviewer contributed two articles: «Initiation: Christian perspectives» (pp. 646-648) and «Governance: Christian perspectives» (pp. 539-541).

Apart from the one or two comments on coverage or small errors, this is a superb encyclopedia which deserves to be on the shelves of any serious theological library. It is an ideal reference work not only on Christian monasticism but also on the other forms of religious life in the non-Christian religions. It will be a welcome source of information for students for many years to come.

RICHARD COPSEY, O.Carm.

*Carmelite Friars,
63 East End Road,
East Finchley
London N2 0SE*

The Encyclopedia of the Middle Ages, editors ANDRÉ VAUCHEZ in association with BARRIE DOBSON & MICHAEL LAPIDGE, James Clarke & Co., Cambridge 2000. 2 vols., 1.664 pages, 600 monochrome & 40 colour illustrations. ISBN 0-227-67931-8. £ 195; Euro 325,00.

If it were not for the price of these two volumes, this massive encyclopedia would deserve to be on the shelves of every serious student of medieval history. Sadly, the cost will probably limit it to the shelves of reference libraries and professional historians. However, the two tomes form a really impressive compilation. Originally, the encyclopedia was published in a French edition and then emerged later in an Italian translation. However, although English readers have had to wait slightly longer for their edition, the wait has had some advantages. The choice and slant of many of the articles betrays the French origins of the encyclopedia and when the work was being prepared in Italian by Claudio Leonardi, the opportunity was taken to add a number of new entries to make it more representative for an Italian readership. The same has now been done for the English edition with fifty extra articles added and bibliographies brought up-to-date. Barrie Dobson and Michael Lapidge are to be commended on their editorial efforts and also a special mention should go to the translator, Adrian Walford, who has produced a readable and elegant text. Those linguistically able historians who rushed out to buy the original French version will now be regretting their impetuosity.

The coverage of this work is very impressive with 3,200 articles covering an enormous range of subjects and individuals. Inevitably, France and French interests have a privileged place but this encyclopedia is a marvellous reference work for anyone with an interest in the Middle Ages. Its coverage is such that it occupies an important niche in between the more popular but cursory one volume encyclopedias and the enormously expensive, multi-volume works such as the 12 volume *Dictionary of the Middle Ages* (New York, 1982-1989). It is the sort of publication which will be a treasure for any serious library.

The coverage of Carmelite topics is probably the one area where a member of the Order will feel disappointed. The one column entry «Carmelites» (p. 242) is by Max Huot de Longchamp, who will be familiar to Carmelite scholars for his efforts in assisting the publication of the works of John of St. Sampson, but who is not a recognised expert on medieval Carmelite history. His article gives a brief general coverage of the Order during the Middle Ages, but seems unaware of recent historical advances. For example, he attributes the gathering of the Latin hermits together on Mount Carmel to Aymeric of Malifaye, without being aware of Adrian Staring's explanation of how this legend arose: see Staring's *Medieval Carmelite Heritage* (Rome 1989). The bibliography at the end of the article refers only to the history of the Order by Joachim Smet in its English and Italian versions and to the collection of Carmelite texts by F. de Sainte-Marie, *Les plus vieux textes du Carmel* (Paris 1944). This last work has long since been replaced by Fr. Staring's more scholarly edition mentioned above. The recent researches of Ludovico Saggi, Emmanuele Boaga and others seem to have been unnoticed. Max Huot de Longchamp contributes another very brief entry on «Simon Stock» (p. 1357), where his information is largely derived from Joachim Smet's history and is surprising mainly for the claim that Our Lady appeared to Simon «perhaps on the occasion of a shipwreck on the Spanish coast»!

Elsewhere, the short article by Anne-Marie Eddé on «Albert of Jerusalem» (p. 29) covers the major details of his life but clearly appeared too early for Vincenzo Mosca's major study, *Alberto, Patriarca di Gerusalemme* (Edizioni Carmelitane, Roma 1996). Peter Biller contributes an entry on «Thomas Netter» which is concise and accurate. This seems to be an entry added for the English edition as the two entries in the bibliography are Anne Hudson's *The Premature Reformation* (Oxford, 1988) and the first volume of *Carmel in Britain*, ed. Patrick Fitzgerald-Lombard (Rome 1992). The one other Carmelite to merit an individual entry is Filippo Lippi («Lippi, Filippo» pp. 853-854). This one column entry is by Maria Chiara Stendardi and, in the space available, gives an excellent coverage of Filippo Lippi's life, his major paintings and his significance for the history of art. Once again, though, one can guess at the provenance of the entry because all the entries in the bibliography are in Italian.

As might be expected in a major collaborative project of this nature there are the occasional errors, as when the Carmelite Richard Lavenham is described as a Franciscan in the entry on the Lollard «John Purvey» (p. 1201). Overall, though, the standard of the entries is very high and there are many topics where the entries give fresh light on their subject. Carmelite readers would find material of interest in many of the articles such as those on «Elijah» (p. 477), «Elisha» (p. 478), «Mendicants» (pp. 937-938), «Quarrels of the mendicants and seculars» (p. 939), «Mary» (pp. 919-921), «Masaccio» (pp. 921-922), «Richard Fitzralph» (p. 1238) and «Scapular» (p. 1314). Perhaps, sadly, there is no space in this work for many of the significant Carmelite figures during the Middle Ages such as John Baconthorpe, Gerard of Bologna, Michael Aiguani, Baptist of Mantua, etc. The publishers of the English edition were willing to consider some suggestions for further

Carmelite entries but, sadly, it was found that the publication was too far advanced for these to be included.

This encyclopedia will be a major source for anyone with an interest in medieval studies and is the sort of reference work that should feature in any scholarly library. An ideal work for any Carmelite student house providing that it is supplemented by more recent studies on the Order itself.

RICHARD COPSEY, O.Carm.

*Carmelite Friars,
63 East End Road,
East Finchley
London N2 0SE*

JILL R. WEBSTER, *Carmel in Medieval Catalonia, The Medieval Mediterranean: People, Economies and Cultures, 400-1453*, vol. 23, pp. xvii + 202 incl. map + 4 plates, Brill, Leiden 1999. ISBN 90-04-11435-1.

Our knowledge of the history of the Carmelites in Spain was greatly enhanced a decade ago with the publication of the three volume study by Fr. Balbino Velasco, (Balbino Velasco Bayon, O.Carm., *Historia del Carmelo Español*, Institutum Carmelitanum, Rome 1990). Building on the labours of Fr. Balbino, his Carmelite confrere, Fr. Pablo Garrido later produced the first volume of a projected two-volume definitive history of the province of Castille, (Pablo Maria Garrido, O.Carm., *El Solar Carmelitano de San Juan de la Cruz. La antigua provincia de Castilla (1416-1836)*, Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, Madrid 1996). The appearance of Jill Webster's study of the Carmelites in Catalonia marks a further milestone in this progress. Dr. Webster has worked for many years among the records of the friars in Catalonia and has an impressive knowledge of the surviving documents. The bringing together of all her researches into a concise history of the Catalan province during the Middle Ages is an event much to be welcomed. In its coverage and detailed information, her book is very good and Dr. Webster's style of writing is clear and easy to read. Not content with a simple recounting of the development of the province, she includes numerous appendices containing the texts of documents, lists of priors, lectors, graduates, students and royal chaplains as well as an overall list of the friars whom she has traced that were members of the province.

All this detail is very welcome and it is a pity that the text is marred by a number of mistakes and misinterpretations. Among the factual errors is the statement by Dr. Webster (p. 91) that Francesc Martí was «in his third year as *biblicus* [at Paris] in 1372». Leaving aside the fact that a student spent only two years lecturing on the Bible, the precise wording of Dr. Webster's source, the acts of the general chapter in 1372, states that Martí was to begin studying the Bible at Paris in the third year following the chapter, that is from 1374. This type of misreading is repeated at other places in the book. Among other errors which need correction is the explanation of the title «vicar general» as

«probably meaning prior provincial» (p. 63) when, in fact it means someone delegating for the prior general. On page 83, «Thomas Waley» should be Thomas Netter of Walden, and, contrary to Dr. Webster, Netter did not translate Felip Ribot's *De institutione*, this task was undertaken by the Norwich Carmelite, Thomas Bradley or Scrope, c.1435. Also, in recent years, Bede Edwards has not published «a full translation» into English (p. 83 n. 28); in fact, he translated only the first nine chapters of book I.

More worrying, though, are the interpretations which Dr. Webster places on some of her findings. Her claim that «Reading between the lines, for that is the only way to understand the complicated events of the fifteenth century, ...» (p. 123) does nothing to add to the reader's confidence. One hypothesis that she puts forward is that there was a revival of interest in the eremitical life among the Carmelites in the late 1300's, prompted by emergence (c 1390) of Felip Ribot's *De institutione*, a complicated composition which claimed to contain works composed by John the 44th bishop of Jerusalem (387-417), Sibert de Beka (d. 1332), William of Sandwich (*fl.* 1287) and the legendary Cyril, third prior on Mount Carmel (see pp. 80-85). However, this work needs to be read in the context of other events taking place throughout the Order. Shortly before the appearance, in 1374-5, there was a controversy over the origins of the Order in Cambridge which led to the Order being forbidden to teach students. The matter was only settled by John Hornby, the Carmelite *magister regens*, who debated the issue with a Dominican, Peter Stokes, before the Vice-Chancellor and assembled doctors of theology of the university. Around the same time, John of Hildesheim wrote his *Dialogus* which is a defence of the Order written in answer to the criticism of a Franciscan. Felip Ribot's collection of ten books appear shortly afterwards and is in reality a Carmelite fantasy, creating a coherent but totally imaginary history of the Order from the time of Elijah up to the 13th century. Where modern researchers are in some doubt is to whether this huge work contains any elements from earlier sources. The motivation behind the work has almost nothing to do with re-establishing the contemplative life and it needs to be understood as an attempt to provide a coherent and believable account of the origins of the Carmelite Order. The first seven books, reciting an account of the origins of the Order by John 44th bishop of Jerusalem, are an incredible composition and Ribot succeeded so well in his intention that Carmelites were treating this work as genuine for centuries afterwards. The chapters of book I based on Elijah's sojourn at the brook of Carith form an inspiring spiritual treatise and are of value for Carmelites nowadays. However, it seems likely that this book with possibly the early chapters of book II are from some so far untraced patristic source. In order to justify Dr. Webster's hypothesis that this work led to a renewal of the eremitical life, one would need some firmer evidence for the founding of eremitical houses and signs that they traced their inspiration to Ribot. In fact, later reform movements in the fifteenth century, such as the Mantuan reform and that of Jean Soreth, drew their inspiration from other sources.

A second topic where Dr. Webster's interpretation is in question is here consideration of the founding of the Carmelite house in Perelada. Modern historians, such as Balbino Velasco, date the foundation of this house to 1293 (p.

7, n. 23). However, there does exist a foundation document which is found in a 1636 manuscript written by Francesc Font and which survives in the Carmelite archives, Rome. The document claims that the Carmelite house was founded in Perelada on 4th April 1206. However, no modern historian recognises this document as genuine and even Dr. Webster refers to this house's «spurious early foundation» (p. 33). However, she devotes several pages (pp. 34-41) to debating whether the house could have been founded at this early date. There are some interesting features about this document which would lead one to speculate on who might have concocted it and where they derived their information on contemporary details. However, contrary to Dr. Webster's claim that «Fabrication of false documents to support a position was not unknown in the Middle Ages although to the author's knowledge, this would be the first time that considerations of publicity prevailed, overcoming the normal moral scruples expected of a member of a religious community» (p. 39), such spurious documents are not rare in Carmelite history. In the English province alone, there was a claim that the Carmelites came to Bradmer (later Burnham Norton) in 1223, but the house was really founded sometime between 1242-1247, whilst there is a spurious foundation document for the nearby house of Blakeney which Dr. Keith Egan exposed. If there was any truth in the Perelada document, then the house would have featured first due to its seniority in all the lists of foundations but this is just not true. Sadly, one has to accept that medieval chroniclers were not averse to concocting documents to suit their purposes and there is the famous case of the Scottish Benedictine, Fr. Brockie, who, in a later century, concocted a whole series of spurious foundation documents. Sadly, Dr. Webster seems reluctant to accept such a conclusion and returns a number of times to the possibility that Perelada was founded early, e.g. «could the convent if it existed early...» (p. 50) and suggests that maybe a few unofficial members of the Order visited Perelada in 1206 (pp. 35 & 112-113).

These comments apart, Dr. Webster's book contains a lot of valuable information and her researches into the Catalan archives have produced many interesting new details. It is a book which can be used with profit and adds to our knowledge of Carmelite history in the Iberian peninsular. However, it is a book which should be read in conjunction with the works of Fr. Joachim Smet and Fr. Balbino Velasco at hand.

RICHARD COPSEY, O.Carm.

*Carmelite Friars,
3 East End Road,
East Finchley
London N2 0SE*

LIBRI AD CONSILIUM COMMENTARIORUM MISSI

- ARZANI, MARIA GREGORIO, O.S.B., *Corpo e spirito, trasparenza di Dio: Itala Mela*, (Testi mistici, 3), Libreria Editrice Vaticana, 00120 Città del Vaticano 2002, pp. 189. ISBN 88-209-7326-X. Euro 9,00.
- BEATRIJS VAN NAZARETH, *De zeven manieren van minne*, Ingeleid en vertaald door Jos Huls, (Mystieke teksten en thema's, 19). Carmelitana, Burgstraat 46, 9000 Gent 2002, pp. 102. ISBN 90-76671-27-3.
- CAMPONE, MARIA CAROLINA, *La mistica comunione; le omelie dello Pseudo Macario*, (Testi Mistici), Libreria Editrice Vaticana, 00120 Città del Vaticano 2002, pp. 274. ISBN 88-209-7243-3. Euro 16,00.
- The Catholic Church, Morality And Politics; Readings in Moral Theology*, no. 12, Paulist press, 997 Macaurthur Blvd., Mahwah, 07430 NJ 2001, pp. xiii, 384. ISBN 0-8091-4040-3. \$ 34.95.
- Cultura della vita e cultura della morte nella Sicilia del '900* (Quaderni di Synaxis, 15), a cura di SALVATORE CONSOLI e MAURIZIO ALIOTTA, Giunti Gruppo Editoriale, Firenze 2002, pp. 223. ISBN 88-090198-1. Euro 12,50.
- CUVILLIER, ELIAN, *Maria chi sei veramente? I differenti volti della madre di Gesù nel Nuovo Testamento*, (Piccola Collana Moderna, serie biblica, 95), Claudiana Editrice, Via Principe Tommaso I, 10125 Torino 2002, pp. 82. ISBN 88-7016-437-3. Euro 5,00.
- DEL GENIO, MARIA ROSARIA, *Armida Barelli, un'esperienza di mistica apostolica laicale*, (Profili, 7), Libreria Editrice Vaticana, 00120 Città del Vaticano 2002, pp. 227. ISBN 88-209-7273-5. Euro 10,00.
- DUMONT, CLAIRE, *Comme un feu dévorant, la Sagesse*, (Flèche de feu, 4), Abbaye de Bellefontaine, 49122 Bégrolles en Mauges 2002, pp. 271. ISBN 2-85589-804-8. Euro 18,50.
- FARAONE, JOSÉ MARIO, *La inhabitación trinitaria según San Juan de la Cruz*, (Analecta Gregoriana, 284), Editrice Pontificia Università Gregoriana, Piazza della Pilotta 35, 00187 Roma 2002, pp. 489. ISBN 88-7652-903-0. Euro 33,00; \$ 33.
- FARLEY, MARGARET A., *Compassionate Respect; a Feminist Approach to Medical Ethics And Other Questions*, 2002, v, 99 p. Paulist press, 997 Mac Arthur Blvd., Mahwah, 07430 NJ 2002, pp. 99. ISBN 0-8091-4115-9. \$ 7.95.
- FIORANO, LUCA, *La libertà del Golgotha*, Le Chateau, via Trottechien 51, 11100 Aosta s.d., ISBN 88-87214-54-9. Euro 12,00.

- FLAMAN, PAUL, *Genetic Engineering, Christian Values And Catholic Teaching*, Paulist press, 997 Mac Arthur Blvd., Mahwah, 07430 NJ 2002, pp. x, 138. ISBN 0-8091-4089-6. \$ 12.95.
- GIOVANNA DELLA CROCE, O.C.D., *Scivias; il nuovo cielo e la nuova terra, Ildegarda di Bingen*, (Testi mistici, 4), Libreria Editrice Vaticana, 00120 Città del Vaticano 2002, pp. 259. ISBN 88-209-7322-7. Euro 30,00.
- MALHAM, JOSEPH M., *By Fire into Light; Four Catholic Martyrs of the Nazi Camps*, (Fiery Arrow, 4). Peeters, Bondgenotenlaan 153, 3000 Leuven 2002, pp. 285. ISBN 90-429-1162-X. Euro 29,00.
- MARIA MADDALENA DE' PAZZI. *Les quarante jours*, Édition établie et annotée par GIANFRANCO TUVERI, O.CARM., Jérôme Millon, 3, place Vaucanson, 38000 Grenoble 2002, pp. 217. ISBN 2-84137-132-8. Euro 26,00.
- MEESTER, CONRAD DE, *Lorenzo della Risurrezione; nel sole della presenza di Dio*, Libreria Editrice Vaticana, 00120 Città del Vaticano 2002, pp. 111.
- MEESTER, CONRAD DE, *Mon âme a soif de toi; silence et prière*, (Formation à la vie intérieure), Éditions du Sarment, 2001, pp. 149. Euro 10,00.
- MODUGNO, ALESSANDRA, *Heidegger e Sciacca; essere, persona, libertà, tempo*, (Collana del Dipartimento di Studi sulla Storia del Pensiero Europeo «Michele Federico Sciacca», Università di Genova, sezione «Saggi Filosofici», 17), Marsilio, Venezia 2001, pp. 125. ISBN 88-317-7884-6. Euro 13,00.
- OBERTI, ARMANDO, *La «Città dell'uomo» nel mistero di Dio: Giuseppe Lazzati*, (Testi mistici, 5), Libreria Editrice Vaticana, 00120 Città del Vaticano 2002, pp. 189. ISBN 88-209-7329-4. Euro 9,00.
- OTTONELLO, PIER PAOLO, *Sciacca, l'anticonformismo costruttivo*, (Collana del Dipartimento di Studi sulla Storia del Pensiero Europeo «Michele Federico Sciacca», Università di Genova, sezione «Saggi Filosofici», 15), Marsilio, Venezia 2000, pp. 134. ISBN 88-317-7631-2. Euro 12,91.
- OTTONELLO, PIER PAOLO, *Scudisciate all'estetica* (Collana del Dipartimento di Studi sulla Storia del Pensiero Europeo «Michele Federico Sciacca», Università di Genova, sezione «Saggi Filosofici», 16), Marsilio, Venezia 2000, pp. 84. *ISBN 88-317-7637-1. Euro 10,33.
- OTTONELLO, PIER PAOLO, *L'uomo «equivoco»*, 2001, 136 p. (Collana del Dipartimento di Studi sulla Storia del Pensiero Europeo «Michele Federico Sciacca», Università di Genova, sezione «Saggi Filosofici», 19), Marsilio, Venezia 2001, pp. 136. ISBN 88-317-7886-2. Euro 13,00.
- RASCHINI, MARIA ADELAIDE, *Concretezza e astrazione*, Marsilio, Venezia 2000, pp. 103. ISBN 88-317-7636-3. Euro 11,36.
- RASCHINI, MARIA ADELAIDE, *La dialettica dell'integralità*, Marsilio, Venezia 2000, pp. 218. ISBN 88-317-7600-2. Euro 18,08.

- RASCHINI, MARIA ADELAIDE, *La filosofia dell'Illuminismo*, Marsilio, Venezia 2000, pp. 582. ISBN 88-317-7527-8. Euro 38,73.
- RASCHINI, MARIA ADELAIDE, *Gentile e il neoidealismo*, Marsilio, Venezia 2001, pp. 313. ISBN 88-317-7799-1. Euro 25,82.
- RASCHINI, MARIA ADELAIDE, *Interpretazioni socratiche*, Marsilio, Venezia 2000, pp. 326. ISBN 88-317-7548-0. Euro 25,82.
- RASCHINI, MARIA ADELAIDE, *Michelstaedter*, Marsilio, Venezia 2000, pp. 172. ISBN 88-317-7598-7. Euro 15,49.
- RASCHINI, MARIA ADELAIDE, *Nietzsche e la crisi dell'occidente*, Marsilio, Venezia 2000, pp. 176. ISBN 88-317-7459-X.
- RASCHINI, MARIA ADELAIDE, *L'organismo del sapere*, Marsilio, Venezia 2001, pp. 301. ISBN 88-317-7863-3. Euro 24,79.
- RASCHINI, MARIA ADELAIDE, *Pedagogia e antipedagogia*, Marsilio, Venezia 2001, pp. 715. ISBN 88-317-7886-2. Euro 46,48.
- RASCHINI, MARIA ADELAIDE, *Prospettive rosminiane*, Marsilio, Venezia 2000, pp. 194. ISBN 88-317-7629-0. Euro 16,53.
- RASCHINI, MARIA ADELAIDE, *Responsabilità storica della filosofia*, Marsilio, Venezia 2001, pp. 643. ISBN 88-317-7705-X. Euro 41,32.
- RASCHINI, MARIA ADELAIDE, *Rosmini e l'idea di progresso*, Marsilio, Venezia 2000, pp. 144. ISBN 88-317-7705-X.
- RASCHINI, MARIA ADELAIDE, *Studi sulla «Teosofia»*, p. Marsilio, Venezia 2000, pp. 137. ISBN 88-317-7456-5.
- RASCHINI, MARIA ADELAIDE, *Studi su Platone e Plotino*, Marsilio, Venezia 2000, pp. 99. ISBN 88-317-7623-1. Euro 11,36.
- SACCOMANI, SARA, *Giovanni Miegge, teologo e pastore*, (Piccola Collana Moderna, serie storica, 94), Claudiana Editrice, Via Principe Tommaso I, 10125 Torino 2002, pp. 238. ISBN 88-7016-384-9. Euro 14,50.
- SFAMENI GASPARRO, GIULIA, *Oracoli, profeti, Sibille; rivelazione e salvezza nel mondo antico*, (Biblioteca di scienze religiose, 171), Libreria Ateneo Salesiano, Piazza dell'Ateneo Salesiano, 1, 00139 Roma 2002, pp. 489. ISBN 88-213-0482-5. Euro 31,00.
- STINISSEN, WILFRIED, O.C.D., *Zorg om de ziel*, Uitgeverij Meinema, Zoetermeer; Carmelitana, Burgstraat 46, 9000 Gent 2002, pp. 102. ISBN 90-211-3899-9 (Nederland); ISBN 90-76671-29-X (België).
- VELASCO BAYÓN, BALBINO, O.CARM., *História da Ordem do Carmo em Portugal*, Paulinas, rua Alexandre Rey Colaço 7, 1700-023 Lisboa 2001, pp. 755. ISBN 972-751-442-1.

- Una visione della vita e della teologia, Giovanni Miegge (1900-1961)*, Claudiana Editrice, Via Principe Tommaso I, 10125 Torino 2002, pp. 176. ISBN 88-7016-424-1. Euro 10,00.
- WEST, ELIZABETH, *Gelukkig zijn, hier en nu; het achtvoudige pad van Jezus in boeddhistisch licht*, Carmelitana, Burgstraat 46, 9000 Gent 2002, pp. 132. ISBN 90-76671-28-11.
- WILDE, ANNA MARIA DE - INY DRIESSEN, *Bij dag, bij nacht; psalmen herschreven*, Carmelitana, Burgstraat 46, 9000 Gent 2002, pp. 71. ISBN 90-76671-31-1.
- ZAMBRUNO, ELISABETTA, *Filosofia e teologia in Tomás de Jesús*, (Collana di filosofia, 76), Marietti 1820, Genova 2002, pp. 345; e-mail: marietti1820@split.it. ISBN 88-211-8683-0. Euro 22,00.

Cum permissu superiorum

C A R M E L U S

Direttore responsabile: Emanuele Boaga

Proprietà della Curia Generalizia dei Carmelitani dell'Antica Osservanza:
via Giovanni Lanza, 138, - 00184 ROMA, Italia

Direzione e Redazione: Via Sforza Pallavicini, 10 - 00193, Italia

Amministrazione: Edizioni Carmelitane, Via Sforza Pallavicini, 10 - 00193 Roma Italia
Registrato alla Cancelleria Tribunale di Roma, Decr. 3637 del 4.1.1954
