PETER ELIAS MAGENNIS IN AMERICA

† ALFRED ISACSSON, O.CARM.*

In his monumental history of the Carmelites, Joachim Smet deals with Peter Elias Magennis as prior general (1919-1931) but leaves his work in the Irish Freedom Movement for "other bards to sing." We hope with this article to be one such bard. Eamon De Valera wrote his school mate, Lawrence D. Flanagan, O.Carm., seeking information about the Carmelites' participation in the Freedom Movement. Flanagan answered that he thought Magennis kept no records of his activity in this area. Despite this thought of Flanagan, much of the activity of Magennis was recorded and has been uncovered.

The election of Magennis as general in 1919 was described by De Valera as "a severe setback to the cause of Irish freedom." Robert Brennan, an Irish official in Washington, stated that Magennis had a great part in reorganizing the movement after 1916.⁴ Stating that Peter Magennis played a major part in Irish national affairs, Brian Murphy, O.S.B., called him "one of the most eminent figures in America identified with the ideals of 1916." The perennial Socialist Party candidate for president, Norman Thomas, described his

^{*} This article was sent to us by Fr. Alfred Isacsson, O.Carm. who died on the 6th of September, 2011 at the age of seventy-nine, as this Review was about to go to the printer. We publish it here as a mark of respect for Fr. Alfred's dedication to the Carmelite Order and his devotion to study, particularly in the area of the history of the North American Province of St. Elias of which he was a member. The very many publications by him, at times provocative, remain as a testament to his deep commitment.

¹ JOACHIM SMET, *The Carmelites. A History of the Brothers of Our Lady of Mount Carmel*, vol. IV, Darien-Ill.; Carmelite Spiritual Center, 1988, 199.

 $^{^2}$ Flanagan to De Valera, Williamstown, Jan 14, 1963, Archives New York Province (ANYP).

 $^{^3}$ Speech of De Valera at a Carmelite dinner at Whitefriars St. in Dublin. Copy sent to Donal O'Callaghan, July 28, 1960, ANYP.

⁴ Brennan to O'Callaghan, Washington, Mar 24, 1943, ANYP.

 $^{^{5}}$ Brian Murphy, OSB, The Catholic Bulletin and Republican Ireland, Belfast 2005. 257.

acquaintance with Magennis as "one of the delightful memories of my life." Thomas spoke at Irish gatherings Magennis presided over.⁶ Magennis was a member of the Clan and the Irish Republican Brotherhood (I.R.B.) both secret organizations directed to the freedom of Ireland as was Magennis' public organization, the Geraldines of New York.⁷ Mary McWhorter found Magennis' words so encouraging that she actively participated in the struggle for Irish independence. She felt that Magennis' efforts were so effective that the Carmelites and their priory remained a refuge for those "whose activities in Ireland made a temporary absence from there imperative." Sean Nunan an aide in De Valera's bond drive, described the Carmelite Priory as a kind of post office for messages. He described Magennis and others as always having the door "on the latch."

We hope to show how these praises of Peter Elias Magennis were well founded, that he was a moving force in the Irish Freedom Movement. He was born in County Armagh, Ireland on February 19, 1868. He was professed a Carmelite on March 3, 1889. After his ordination in 1894, Peter Elias Magennis spent four years at White-friars Street, Dublin and at Knocktopher. In 1898, he went to the missions in Australia where he remained until 1906. After serving two more years in Ireland, Magennis was elected 1908 an assistant general of the order.

It is possible that Magennis came to the United States in 1910 to preach parish missions. A parish mission was a service that endured for a week or two. There was usually a morning sermon with Mass and a major presentation in the evening with services like the Rosary or Benediction followed by confessions. It was a long day's work for those giving the mission and the Irish Carmelites did this work to earn money to support the formation of the young Carmelites. It is definite that Magennis, Edward Southwell and Berchmans Devlin did missions in New York and Philadelphia in 1911.¹⁰

Peter Magennis arrived in New York in 1912 as the "Apostolic Visitator of the Carmelites in America." It is possible that he did missions while there. ¹¹ We have no evidence that he or others gave

⁶ Thomas to O'Callaghan, NY, Nov 19, 1943, ANYP.

 $^{^7}$ O'Callaghan Interviews and Notes; McDermott to O'Callaghan, NY, Oct 16, 1943, both ANYP.

⁸ McWhorter to O'Callaghan, Chicago, Mar 24, 1941, ANYP.

⁹ Nunan to O'Callaghan, Washington, Nov 17, 1943, ANYP.

¹⁰ Parish Bulletin, Our Lady of the Scapular, March and September, 1911.

¹¹ Irish World (NY), (IW) Aug 31, 1912.

missions during 1913 but from 1914 to 1918, Magennis and other Carmelites gave missions. John Cogan, the Irish provincial, had requested from the general, John Lorenzoni, the use of his assistant, Peter Magennis, for parish missions in America. After this granted request, it seems to have been presumed that this work was able to continue. A study has been made of the parish missions from 1914 to 1918 which featured Magennis. Those that stand out are four weeks at Saint Anthony's in Greenpoint, NY and for the same period at Saint Anthony's in Philadelphia. 13

In 1913, Magennis did a visitation of the Manhattan house. He severely criticized the lack of discipline and the manner of keeping accounts. Paul O'Dwyer, prior and pastor, complained of these accusations. He described Magennis' way of acting in the words of Cardinal Farley of New York as being compulsive and not prudent. He also accused Magennis as having special friends among the Carmelites. O'Dwyer said that all knew he and Magennis had a falling out and that he was in the black book. There was no definite resolution here but O'Dwyer was transferred that year to Ireland.¹⁴

Magennis was present for missions in 1914, 1915 and 1916 and in this latter year, he seems to have remained until that July. He returned to New York that fall and remained until 1917 when he did missions and remained until August, 1919 when he returned to Ireland for their provincial chapter and then proceeded to Rome for the general chapter.¹⁵

Magennis and the Carmelite Mission Band had a heavy schedule in 1917. The bookings went from the end of February to the end of October, in a total of nineteen parishes.¹⁶

That June, Magennis gave the commencement address at the Carmelite School and preached at the Golden Jubilee of Edward Southwell, one of the original four Carmelites who came to New York in 1889.¹⁷ That fall, it was rumored that Magennis was resigning the

¹² Cogan to Lorenzoni, Terenure, Mar 9, 1914, CG, Hib, (1906-21), Archives of the Order (AO).

¹³ JEROME BAUER, O. CARM., "Carmelite Mission Band," Vestigium 4 (June, 1960), 6-13; Catholic News (NY), May 8, 1915, Oct 5, 1918; D. B. Devlin, Diary, Archives Irish Province.

¹⁴ PETER O'DWYER, A True Patriot, Dublin 1975, 9; Alfred Isacsson, Carmel in New York, 1906-1926, Maspeth 1979, 91-95.

¹⁵ A. ISACSSON, Carmel, 146.

¹⁶ Catholic News (NY), Jan 6, Apr 11, 1917.

¹⁷ Ibid., June 12, 1915; Vestigium I, No 3 (June, 1957) 6-10.

post of assistant general. He did submit his resignation to the Congregation for Religious but they would not accept it until Magennis returned to Rome which he felt was not possible because of his mission work and the danger of submarine warfare. He remained assistant general.

Peter Elias Magennis was present at the Céilí of the Gaelic Society on December 29, 1915 where Mr. Lawler spoke on "Irish Christmas Customs." Magennis moved for a vote of thanks to Lawler and stated that the Irish influence on Christianity and civilization was not sufficiently appreciated by the Irish themselves.¹⁹ Magennis spoke to this same group on Saint Patrick at their celebration of the saint's feast on March 17.²⁰

"Saint Patrick, Lawgiver and Ecclesiastic" was the subject of Magennis lecture to the Gaelic Society that March. He harmonized ancient Irish law with Christianity. He cited the warring nations of Europe being at each other's throat. While this was going on, "The nation [England] that bared the back of Mother Erin and plied the lash until the Niobe of Nations fell again and again in the soil bedewed in her own blood." This began his attack on England and after more of it, he showed how Ireland and the spirit of its Brehan Code would bring peace and wisdom to nations. Magennis concluded with the phrase, "How much better it is to be in Ireland dreaming of America than in America dreaming of Ireland." Magennis also preached the annual Saint Patrick Novena at Our Lady of the Scapular.

The ministry of Lawrence Flanagan, Peter Elias Magennis and Edward Southwell offered a solemn requiem Mass on May 15, 1916 for those who died in the April rising in Dublin.²³

The Friends of Irish Freedom (F.O.I.F.) was organized in March, 1916 at the Irish Race Convention in New York City. Its purpose was stated in its title. Though the Carmelite Branch would be one of the most active and largest of the Branches, it was not inaugurated until a year later.²⁴ The pastor, Denis O'Connor was the president of the Carmelite Branch and was active in it as was Peter Magennis.

¹⁸ Cogan to Lorenzoni, Dublin, Oct 6, Nov 2, 1915; Magennis to Lorenzoni, NY, [Nov, 1915], CG, Generali 2, AO.

¹⁹ Gaelic American (NY), (GA) Jan 8, 1916; IW, Jan 8, 1916.

²⁰ GA, Mar 4, 1916; IW, Feb 19, 1916.

²¹ IW, Mar 25, 1916.

²² GA, Mar 9, 1916.

²³ IW, May 20, 1916.

²⁴ IW, July 14, 1917; GA, June 23, 1917.

Accounts of meetings of New York Branches of the F.O.I.F. have Magennis present and mentioned as a speaker. Presumably, he did not give a formal talk on these occasions but was merely called upon to say a few words which indicate the esteem he commanded in the organization.²⁵

Speaking to the Patrick Pearse Branch of the F.O.I.F. in Harlem, Peter Magennis told the audience that he had strongly supported Redmond's Constitutional Movement and that many members of the Irish Parliament were his dear friends. He said he had come to believe that the only sure way to gain Ireland's complete independence was to make good the threat of physical force. He closed by saying that nearly all of Ireland's recent martyrs were his personal friends and had done more for Ireland in one week than the constitutional movement had done in a century.²⁶ Clearly, Magennis was in favor of using force to obtain independence.

During 1917, the Irish student house in Rome, *San Celso e Giuliano*, was established. It was a pet project of Magennis but he could not do much for its promotion while he was in the United States. Despite this he was credited for this accomplishment.²⁷

At a meeting of the Pearse Branch of the F.O.I.F. in Floral Gardens, Queens, NY, Magennis spoke of the civic elements against the Irish and cited the Irish priesthood as being against these elements. He was described as "an able exponent of that rugged, heart-stirring, fearless eloquence, typical of the men from his native province of Ulster." Magennis told of how he had traveled through much of Europe during the past year and saw how nations had received their rights. He asked why not Ireland? He attacked the American press for their support of England and citing witnesses of the attacks on Irish freedom demonstrators, called the police the "minions" of England. Magennis praised the courts who had released all the demonstrators.²⁸

Towards the end of that year, Magennis again attacked the American press in a talk at the Carmelite Branch. He also emphasized the importance of educating the young in their Irish history and

²⁵ IW, Oct 27, Nov 17, Dec 1, Dec 22, 1917; GA, Dec 8, 1917.

²⁶ GA, June 24, 1916.

 $^{^{27}}$ Cogan to Lorenzoni, Dublin, Jan 28, 1917, CG, Hib (1906-21); Magennis to Lorenzoni, NY, Apr 3, 1918, CG, Generali 2, both in AO; *Catholic News* (NY), Sept 1, 1917.

²⁸ GA, Sept 15, 1917.

culture and promoted the Thursday classes in these at the Carmelite School.²⁹

Despite being ill, Peter Elias Magennis spoke at a meeting of Cumann na mBan at New York's Maennerchor Hall on February 7, 1918. Despite the doctor's prohibition, he felt the meeting was too important to miss. He appealed for funds for the Cumann na Ban. He cited his opinion that President Wilson and America were for the independence of Ireland but they had to speak out more and bring their feelings out to the public.³⁰

A group that seems to have been organized around 1918 was the Citizens of the Irish Republic. They attended the 10:00 AM Mass each Sunday at Our Lady of the Scapular and met in the hall afterwards. Peter Magennis and Denis O'Connor were associated with the Citizens and directed them to various activities associated with the fight for Irish freedom.³¹

Street Preachers explaining the goals of the Irish Freedom Movement were prominent in this period. The Carmelite Branch and Peter Magennis were not active in this movement but the speakers did address the Carmelite Branch. Magennis defended the rights of the preachers and valued their work.³²

Magennis chaired the Easter Week meeting of the United Irish Societies of New York at Carnegie Hall on March 31, 1917, beginning with the statement that the position of chairman in the United States differs very much from the chairman in Ireland, as the chairman in Ireland does, Magennis said he would speak very little. He drew a parallel from those depicted in Saint Stephen's Church in Rome torturing Martyrs with those torturing Ireland. The tormentors have the same joy on their faces. He then got into one of his favorite themes: the contribution of the Irish immigrants in the American Revolution.³³

At the Passionists' monastery in West Hoboken in April, 1918, the children from the Carmelite School performed and Peter Elias Magennis spoke to the a branch of the Gaelic League.³⁴ At the Mass for the martyrs of 1916-1917 at the Carmelite Church, Peter Magennis "preached a powerful and inspiring sermon, eulogizing the martyrs

²⁹ IW, Dec 22, 1917.

³⁰ GA, Feb 16, 1918.

³¹ Butler to author, Philadelphia, Dec 21, 1974, ANYP.

³² WILLIAM CARR, The Irish Carmelites of New York Cityand the Fight for Irish Independence, Middletown, NY, [1973], 33-9; P. O'DWYER, A True, 12.

³³ GA, Apr 6, 1918.

³⁴ IW, May 4, 1918.

and the land for whose liberty they fought and gave their lives."³⁵ At the last ceilidh of the season of the Carmelite Branch on July 18, besides the songs and dances, Magennis gave a short talk appealing for funds for the *Gaelic American* which he called "one of the few papers left to put Ireland's cause before the people of America."³⁶ Because of its anti-British tone, the paper had lost its inexpensive postal rates.

The Irish Progressive League organized a "mass meeting" for Madison Square Garden, then located in East 26th Street and Madison Avenue, for the evening of May 4, 1918. At 9:00 PM, Peter Elias Magennis opened the meeting. He attacked Mrs. William Jay who had tried to prevent the meeting because of its anti-British tone by complaining of the gathering to New York Life the owner of the Garden. Magennis, referred to as "Mr.", told of a young American of Irish blood who said to him that when he had finished fighting Germany, he would go to Ireland and fight against England. The tenor of speeches was decidedly anti English, an American ally which caused many to view the meeting as anti American. The meeting was especially against British conscription in Ireland.³⁷

The F.O.I.F. had a convention of 2,500 delegates at the Central Opera House on May 18-19, 1918. English rule was vehemently denounced. Petitions addressed to President Wilson and Congress asked that they take measures to bring about the independence of Ireland. Though there is no record of any speech of Magennis, he is said to have presided over the meeting and was elected president of the organization.³⁸ Later, Magennis stated that when he was elected president, he was hearing confessions at Saint Joseph's Church, Tremont, The Bronx, NY.³⁹ Transcripts of the speeches made at the Central Opera House were given to federal authorities for their examination. The petitions formed at the meeting were in the care of Judge Goff who had not decided whether he would bring them to Washington. Mrs. Francis Barlow brought her protests from the two meetings to Cardinal Farley's residence.⁴⁰ Finally, Monsignor Thomas Carroll, the cardinal's secretary, responded to Mrs. Barlow. He

³⁵ GA, May 25, June 15, 1918.

³⁶ GA, July 13, July 27, 1918; IW, Aug 9, 1919.

³⁷ New York Times, May 5, 1918; GA, June 1, 1918.

³⁸ Ibid., May 19, 1918.

³⁹ Third Irish Race Convention Program, n. p., ANYP.

⁴⁰ New York Times, May 21, 1918.

acknowledged the reception of the protests and made the point that the meeting was not held under the auspices of the Church. He did not believe that Magennis was to preside at the meeting. Farley let Magennis know that he was not to preside at any such meetings in the future.⁴¹

The reaction among the Irish to Farley's injunction was not mild. Letters of protest were sent to Archbishop Giovanni Bonzano, the Apostolic Delegate in Washington. No action seems to have been taken. 42 After the appearance of Farley's letter, Magennis wrote a letter to *The New York Tribune*. He noted that his critics called themselves the Loyal Committee. "In the Revolution days," he wrote, "there were loyalists, too, peculiarly enough from the same class as our modern loyalists. In the great crisis of the young Republic the loyalists persecuted, maligned and slandered George Washington in the interests of England." For himself, Magennis wrote that he always spoke from the rights of representative government and free speech. 43

Giovanni Bonzano, the Apostolic Delegate to the United States, sent a report to Rome concerning the Central Opera House meetings chaired by Magennis. No action seems to have been taken by Rome.⁴⁴

Magennis performed the marriage at the Carmelite Church of Margaret Curley, a famous street preacher and a niece of Boston Mayor James Curley.⁴⁵ This was one of Magennis' favorite methods of publicizing the Irish cause though the Carmelite Branch did not engage in this activity.

Besides appealing for funds for Saint Enda's, a society devoted to the promotion of Gaelic and Irish culture. Magennis continued to raise money for the *Gaelic American* in its problems with the post office. Magennis joined Senators William Borah, a Progressive from Idaho and James Phelan from California as speakers at the Emmet Anniversary celebration of the Clan na Gael. 47

From the summer of 1918 onwards Peter Elias Magennis kept himself busy speaking to various Branches of the F.O.I.F. The

⁴¹ Ibid., May 22, 1918.

⁴² Vatican Archives, Apostolic Delegate, Washington, V, 83/1.

⁴³ GA, June 1, 1918; The New York Tribune, May 23, 1918.

⁴⁴ Bonzano Report, Mar 23, 1920 Pos 239, 126, Secretary of State, Sacred Congregation for Extraordinary Ecclesiastical Affairs, Vatican City.

⁴⁵ Irish Press (Phil), (IP), July 20, 1918.

⁴⁶ IW, July 20, 1918.

⁴⁷ IW, Feb 22, Mar, 15, 1919; GA Mar 15, 1919.

Eccentric Firemen's picnic had Magennis as the referee of Irish dancing. He was that August at the ceilidh and dance of the Thomas McDonough Branch in the Bronx; the main speaker at the opening session of the Padraic Pearse Branch on October 6; at the O'Rahilly Branch in Brooklyn on November 10; at Yonkers, he spoke on Woodrow Wilson's doctrine of freedom for smaller nations. He spoke to the Bishop O'Dwyer Branch on November 24 and the John Holland Branch on December 8.⁴⁸

A meeting of the Irish Progressive League at the Central Opera House aimed at demanding the independence of Ireland had a supporting letter from Magennis read at their gathering.⁴⁹ The next month, he was present at the dedication of the grave monument of Michael Murray by the Clan na Gael on October 20 at Saint Raymond's Cemetery in the Bronx.⁵⁰

Magennis sent a letter to the members of the F.O.I.F. mentioning the convention of that May and stated that its purpose was to form resolutions for presentation to the president and Congress to plea for self determination for Ireland.⁵¹

Speaking at Maennerchor Hall, Peter Magennis including himself said that as American citizens we are inheritors of a glorious past. When President Wilson spoke about the rights of small nations, we backed him. Presently, we Americans are fighting for this. Magennis urged Americans to support these peace conference ideals.⁵² When William Cardinal O'Connell came to Madison Square Garden to address the Irish, Magennis was there. The cardinal praising the faith of the Irish said it had brought them the "dust of humiliation." He stated Ireland's right to be governed only by consent of the governed. That is what the United States did and Ireland relied on the Unites States to echo this principle throughout the world and for Ireland's freedom. The cardinal predicted the freedom of Ireland.⁵³

We have eight letters that Magennis wrote his general, Giovanni Lorenzoni, during 1917 an 1918. He wrote to inform the general of

⁴⁸ IW, Aug 31, Sept 28, Oct 5, Nov 9, Dec 7, 1918; GA, Sept 28, Nov 16, 1918, Dec 7, 1918.

⁴⁹ IP, Sept 28, 1918.

⁵⁰ GA, Oct 19, 26, 1918.

⁵¹ GA, Nov 2, 1918; IP Oct 26, 1918.

⁵² GA, Nov 30, 1918.

⁵³ IW, Dec 14,1918.

what he observed and suggested solutions to problems and difficulties. They contained no information on his Irish activities.⁵⁴

At the National Archives in College Park, MD, there is a group called the "Old German" records. They deal with German sympathizers, suspicious characters and anti English activities at the time of World War I. A search of the indexes of these records reveals the names of Peter Magennis and Liam Mellows. Mellows' refers to a seditious dinner party that he attended while Magennis' refers to "Irish Activities." No other records are extant to explain the Magennis entry.⁵⁵ This shows the government's concern for Magennis and the surveillance of his activities. The only involvement of Magennis in arms shipping is his wave and wishes of good luck to the men carrying the Thompson Submachine guns from the Carmelite Priory where they were sewn into burlap bags to the *East Side* in Hoboken for shipping to Ireland.⁵⁶

At a Clan na Gael meeting at the Central Opera House, Peter Magennis called for rejoicing in what the Clan had done for Ireland. He especially praised the member, John Devoy. He said that ideas have changed about a nation becoming independent. Magennis then appealed for funds to support the Clan. The collection is reported as being good.⁵⁷

On January 6, 1919, Peter Elias Magennis spoke to an overflow crowd at the Central Opera House at a meeting under the sponsorship of the Irish Progressive League. Magennis called the recent General Elections of the British Isles in which Sinn Féin decisively defeated the Irish Parliamentary Party, a clear and decisive cry that Ireland desired nothing less than complete independence. With British armed forces present, most of the candidates in prison and the people oppressed with fear prompted Magennis to see this as the only interpretation of the December 14, 1918 votes.⁵⁸ He made similar remarks at a Clan na Gael meeting on January 5 and at the victory celebration of the Cumann na Ban.⁵⁹ Continuing this notion of Ireland desiring to be free, Magennis, speaking to the Ancient Order of

⁵⁴ CG Generali 2, AO.

 $^{^{55}}$ National Archives and Records Administration, College Park, "Old German" Records, OG 504.

⁵⁶ 150/1309 De Valera Papers, UCD.

⁵⁷ GA, Jan 11, 1919.

⁵⁸ IP, Jan 11, 1919.

⁵⁹ GA, Jan 11,18, 1919; IW Jan 18, 1919.

Hibernians at Mennerchor Hall, demonstrated that Ireland was in good condition to assume its place among the nations of the world. Economics and politics caused him to say this as he tried to instill among his listeners pride in what he called, the "old country."⁶⁰

At a meeting of the Ancient Order of Hibernians at Maennerchor Hall on January 20, Peter Magennis praised the Hibernians for their endorsement and aid of the F.O.I.F. He asked, "Can Ireland stand alone?" His answer was "Yes." He then made a plea to work at the treaties in progress for Ireland's benefit.⁶¹

A Meeting for Ireland was held at the Stratton Theater in Middletown, NY, on February 9, 1919. The theater was so crowded that people had to be turned away. There was a number of speakers and entertainment by the children of the Carmelites' Manhattan parish. Resolutions petitioning President Wilson to present the claims of Ireland to the Paris Peace Conference were made. In this, Magennis expected the backing of the United States as the Irish had fought in all the American wars. In his speech he also concentrated on Ireland's right to independence.⁶²

The Third Irish Race Convention, presided over by Peter Elias Magennis as the president of the F.O.I.F., was held in Philadelphia at the 2nd Regiment Armory February 22 and 23, 1919. The armory was the meeting place on Saturday and on Sunday the Academy of music. In his opening remarks, Magennis questioned the policies of Woodrow Wilson as they involved Ireland but stated that the F.O.I.F. because of its recent growth was the organization to present to America the cause of Ireland. He called for the freedom of Ireland and the removal of oppression. His conclusion was: "Put your trust in God, my boys, and keep your powder dry." Magennis mentioned that he was not at the 2nd Irish Race Convention but was hearing confessions at Saint Joseph's Church, Tremont, the Bronx, when he was elected president. Despite his announcement that he had to leave the country soon, Magennis was again elected the president of the F.O.I.F.⁶³

Judge John Goff and Peter Magennis were delegated to present to President Wilson the resolutions of the Third Irish Race Conven-

⁶⁰ GA, Feb 1, 1919.

⁶¹ Ibid.

⁶² GA, Mar 1, 1919.

⁶³ IW, Mar 1, 1919; Third Irish Race Convention Program, ANYP; Boland Diary, 150/1245 De Valera Papers, University College Dublin (UCD).

tion which were basically a request that he apply to Ireland his policy of self-determination. A letter of a young lady named Maguerite Magennis asked the same of Wilson. Joseph Tumulty hinted the letter was a Magennis trick to gain an audience. Whether Wilson replied to the letter or not, we do not know. The delegates in an enlarged group came to the White House to present the resolutions. Tumulty denied the audience with the president but received the resolutions and gave them to Wilson.⁶⁴

Traveling to Boston, Magennis spoke at the Commons at the Irish Republic Anniversary Celebration praising Cardinal O'Connell for his addressing an Irish meeting at Madison Square Garden. He attacked the loyalists of America's independence days and he cited the presence of the Irish at Bunker Hill, Lexington and Concord. Magennis called for the presence of Irish representatives at the Paris peace conference. He lashed out at the, media of America for their misrepresentation of the views of Ireland.⁶⁵ In the Saint Patrick's Day Parade, March, 1919. a group called the "Carmelites F.O.I.F." marched under the leadership of Peter Magennis who was given the title of Monsignor in the newspaper report. A banner carried by the group said that from 1841 to 1919, the population of Ireland dropped from 8,000,000 to 4.500.00.66 That April, Magennis chaired a meeting of the National Committee of the F.O.I.F. The outcome of the meeting was the launching of a "Recognition of the Irish Republic Week." 67 While he was living at the Carmelite' New York priory, he extended hospitality to those coming incognito from Ireland. Such were Sean Nunan and Harry Boland in 1919,68 Liam Mellows worked in the Carmelite school and when he became ill, Magennis sent him to Saint Albert's, the Carmelite house in Middletown, NY.69

There was a meeting at Madison Square Garden on July 10, 1919 honoring Eamon De Valera whom Magennis led to the dais. He reminded his audience that he was an American citizen, something he

 $^{^{64}}$ Charles C. Tansill, America and the Fight for Irish Freedom, New York, 1957, 272-273.

⁶⁵ IW, Feb 7, Mar 3, 1919.

⁶⁶ New York Times, Mar 18, 1919.

⁶⁷ IW, Apr 19, 1919; GA, Apr 19, 1919.

⁶⁸ Sean Nunan, "President De Valera's Mission in the USA, 1919-20," Capuchin Annual 37 (1970) 236-49; DAVID FITZPATRICK, Harry Boland's Irish Revolition, Cork 2003, 123, 127.

⁶⁹ C. DESMOND GREAVES, *Liam Mellows and the Irish Revolution*, London 1971, 207; Mellows Diary 150/956 De Valera Papers, UCD.

had obtained the previous month from Judge Learned Hand, the outstanding jurist and inclined to be favorable to Irish causes. Mentioning the bravery of American soldiers, he said the Irish never refused to fight with them for America. They simply refused to fight for England, their oppressors.⁷⁰

When Eamon De Valera made his first American appearance June 23 at the Waldorf Astoria, the picture in the *New York Times* showed Magennis with him. De Valera had arrived secretly by ship early in the month and went first to the Carmelite Priory at 338 East 29th Street. In a two week period, he visited his mother in Rochester, his half-brother Father Thomas Wheelwright, CSSR, in Boston and Joseph McGarrity in Philadelphia. The June 23 appearance was his introduction to America where he was to present his loan for \$ 5,000,000. In his sedan from the Carmelite Priory, Peter Elias Magennis was in the rear seat with him.⁷¹

That June, De Valera attended the commencement of the Carmelite School. He also attended with Peter Magennis, and Liam Mellows, who accompanied him from the Waldorf Astoria on June 22 and June 25, days of Gaelic music and dances. As the *Irish World* stated, he must have seen that the cause of Ireland was not dead but thriving in the land of the stars and stripes. In 1919, the Carmelites transferred their feast of Our Lady of Mount Carmel to Sunday, July 12. In the novena, which seems to have been after the feast, various Carmelites gave sermons but Magennis preached "The Second Privilege of the Scapular" and "The Friars of the Order of Our Lady of Mount Carmel" on July 17 and 20 respectively.

There was a meeting at Madison Square Garden to honor Eamon De Valera. Peter Elias Magennis accompanied him to the dais. In his remarks, Magennis made clear his American citizenship which nation, he called the greatest. He said that if Northern Ireland had listened and Southern Ireland had talked, there would be one Ireland. He also praised President De Valera. Father Francis Duffy made the sad comment that so many Irish in his 69th Regiment would die strengthening their Irish oppressor.⁷⁴

⁷⁰ IW, IP, July 19, 1919.

 $^{^{71}\,}$ IW, June 28, 1919; New York Times, June 24, 1919; 150/688, 150/263 De Valera Papers, UCD; McGarrity Papers, 17608, National Library of Ireland.

⁷² IW, July 5, 1919.

⁷³ Catholic News (NY), July 12, 1919.

⁷⁴ IW, July 19, 1919.

Towards the end of the summer of 1919, Peter Elias Magennis was preparing to leave for the Irish provincial chapter and the Carmelite general chapter in Rome. The F.O.I.F. had a farewell for him at which an illuminated copy of a farewell and a portable altar were given him. Praise was given for all that he had done in America.⁷⁵ Carmelites were at the pier to see him off.⁷⁶

Peter Elias Magennis went to Ireland for his province's chapter. From there he went on to Rome for the general chapter of the order. There he was elected prior general requiring his presence in Rome for most of his time. After his election, he sent a letter to The Monitor (Newark, NJ) in which he regretted Woodrow Wilson going to Europe with his hat in hand, to explain the demands of the greatest nation on earth. He reported that the Daily News of London claimed that Cardinal Mercier was sent to the United States to squelch the American opposition to the United Nations and that Magennis was called to Rome because of his conflict with Cardinal Farley. In response, Magennis wrote that Farley's sentiments should not be judged by the one Madison Square Garden rally incident because it was in his old age and on the eve of his demise.⁷⁷ The British diplomats in Rome tried to forestall the confirmation of Magennis as general of his order and according to the press, Benedict XV was embarrassed by this effort.78

Writing from Rome at the start of the year, 1920, Magennis praised the work in Rome of Monsignors Hagan and O'Riordan of the Irish College for doing so much to bring the story of Ireland and her struggles to the attention of all in Rome. The election of Bishop Thomas Gallagher as president of the F.O.I.F. was assailed in the *Irish Press* because it was seen as an attempt to have a pliable person in charge. The ouster of Magennis was seen as regrettable. Felection as general, requiring permanent residence in Rome, was seen as requiring the resignation as president of the FOIF. That August of 1920, he did resign this post. By this time, there was the split in the F.O.I.F. between the Cohalan and De Valera supporters. The *Irish World* reported that Magennis was to come to New York in the near

⁷⁵ IW, Aug 23, 1919; IP, Aug 27, 1919.

⁷⁶ IW, Aug 30, 1919.

⁷⁷ IW, Oct 17, Oct 25, Nov 8, 1919; New York Times Oct 17, 1919.

⁷⁸ IW, IP, Nov 1, 1919.

⁷⁹ Aug 7, 1920.

⁸⁰ C.C. Tansill, America, 387; Catholic News (NY) Aug 1, 1920

future to resume his influence. The "clique" with "indecent haste" elected and installed Bishop Gallagher of Detroit. He was a tool of the "clique." Money from the Victory Fund, intended for Ireland, was being used.⁸¹

In January, 1920, writing from Rome, Magennis asked for unity in the Irish cause. An American knows his history and takes pride in his country. The Irish must do the same. He then urged his readers to continue the fight and he railed against British brutality.⁸² When an article in the *Gaelic American*, the newspaper of John Devoy, said the De Valera crowd misused funds, Sean T. O'Kelly from Cosiona, Italy and Magennis from Rome each sent a telegram denying the charge.⁸³ Diarmund Lynch, the Secretary of the F.O.I.F., wrote Magennis that he was shocked at Magennis' attack on the new leadership of the F.O.I.F. Lynch understood that Magennis wanted Frank P. Walsh to succeed him but Walsh never attended any meetings. Magennis' resignation was read at a meeting and this started the rumor he was forced out. Gallagher was elected because he was present. Lynch warned that those trying to destroy the F.O.I.F. were headed for disaster.⁸⁴

The F.O.I.F. became encamped in the plans of Judge Daniel Cohalan which were not those of Eamon De Valera. To counteract this, De Valera announced on October 23, 1920, the formation of the American Association for the recognition of the Irish Republic (A.A.R.I.P.). The Carmelites, ever faithful to De Valera changed their Branch of the F.O.I.F. to Council in the A.A.R.I.P.

Peter Elias Magennis was in the United States on business and a reception was held for him at the Hunt's Point Palace on June 15, 1920. Each speaker paid tribute to Magennis and his efforts for the Irish cause in the United States. When his turn came, Magennis assailed British propaganda released in the United States because it fostered their own interests and hindered those of the Irish. By saying that the World War was for the rights of the people of small nations, England duped the Americans by enticing them into the war. He regretted the present condition of Ireland and said England was using money and equipment supplied by America to repress Irish aspirations. Ireland should plead no longer but demand what the English said the war was for: the rights of small nations.⁸⁵

⁸¹ IW, Aug 7, 1920.

⁸² IW, Jan 17, 1920.

^{83 150/731} De Valera Papers, UCD.

^{84 150/988} Ibid.

⁸⁵ IW, June 25, 1921; Catholic News (NY), June 24, 1921.

A missionary writing the *Irish World* about the split between Eamon De Valera and Judge Cohalan quoted from Peter Elias Magennis, "The moment a man of a machine or an organization or a clique gets bigger than the cause, get away from any or all of them, because they have ceased to be of any good and have begun to do harm, no matter what the past record of any or all of them be."86

Part of Peter Magennis' 1921 visit was to visitate the American houses of the order. This meant finding out how well the members of the order were observing the rules of their life and fulfilling their ministry. Among the New York houses, he wanted support of the formation house, Saint Albert's in Middletown, NY. Intoxicating drink was forbidden in one's room. Suspension from ministry was the penalty for this. Vacation was given only to those who had done a good year's work. The order was to be fairly compensated for any parish work done. Strictness in particular things was the characteristic of Magennis' regulations.⁸⁷

Peter Elis Magennis was at Niagara Falls in June, 1922, probably doing visitation.⁸⁸ That September at the Irish provincial chapter the houses in New York were formed into a commissariate by Magennis.⁸⁹ During part of that year, Magennis was in New York.⁹⁰ Towards the end of the year, he was at Niagara Falls from where he wrote John Hagan, the rector of the Irish College in Rome. Concerning the execution of his friend, Liam Mellows as a hostage by the Free State government, he wrote: "I knew those fellows were contemptible but it never occurred to me they were such vampires. Drunk with their sudden greatness their one idea is to revel in human blood."⁹¹

Unable to attend the Carmelite Council meeting on December 14, 1922, Magennis wrote from the west and mentioned the death of Liam Mellows calling him "the sweetest and noblest soul God ever made." He cited Mellows' work among the children and people of the Carmelite's East Side parish. He praised Liam's mother and all the mothers of Ireland who had seen their sons die. He asked the Council to keep them in their prayers. From Niagara Falls, he was heading farther west.⁹²

⁸⁶ IW, May 21, 1921.

⁸⁷ Visitation Report, Aug 28, 1921, ANYP.

⁸⁸ Magennis to [Franco], Niagara Falls, June 29, 1922, CG, Generali 2, AO.

⁸⁹ Acta Capituli Provincialis, Sept 7, 1922, CG, Hib, Capit et Cong (1900-64), AO.

⁹⁰ O'Connor to De Valera, NY, Dec 18, 1922, 150/1280. De Valera Papers, UCD.

⁹¹ Magennis to Hagan, Niagara Falls, Dec 9, 1922, Archives, Irish College, Rome.

⁹² IW, Dec 23, 1922.

Peter Elias Magennis was present for the Liam Mellows Memorial at the Carmelite Hall on January 28, 1923. There was dancing and singing by the children and Father Denis O'Connor, a violin pupil of Liam, played the man's favorite airs. Magennis lectured on "The Spirit of Liam Mellows." ⁹³

When Denis O'Connor died in 1924 at the premature age of fifty-three, Peter Magennis was deeply affected. The two had attended Terenure College in Dublin together, worked together in Australia and were reunited in New York working for the Irish cause. Magennis felt this loss very deeply and in tribute to his friend dedicated to him a new stained glass window in the chapel at *San Alberto* in Rome.⁹⁴

When he was aging and recalling the events of his past, Eamon De Valera wrote to his old schoolmate at Blackrock College, Lawrence D. Flanagan. Since he had been in the New York Carmelite houses since 1908, Flanagan was present for all of the Irish activities. He assured De Valera that Magennis, who had been present in Rome at the meeting when De Valera's Fianna Fáil party was proposed, never ceased his support of his policies. He called Magennis one of De Valera's most loyal supporters.⁹⁵

1927 saw Magennis coming from South America to New York and feeling the change of climate. He reported that many he met in his visit saw Rome as being badly off. Shortly afterwards, he wrote again this time to Antonino Franco at *San Alberto* about the American students in Rome. He related that he was preaching the July 16 novena in New York to earn money for the Roman college. Just after this, he was honored at a reception in the 29th Street Carmelite Hall.

Magennis had arrived in New York the middle of June, 1927, and went to the chapter of the Most Pure Heart of Mary Province returning to New York about July 1. Then he proceeded to visitate the four houses of the commissariat. The general regulations he established for each house were quite severe. Vacations were set for every five or six years and a serious transgression in obedience lost this right *ipso facto*. All donations, "no matter how trifling" belonged to the house.

⁹³ IW, Feb 23, 1923.

⁹⁴ Carr, The Irish, 15.

⁹⁵ De Valera to Flanagan, Dublin, Dec 17, 1962, Jan 17, 1963; Flanagan to De Valera, Williamstown, Feb 15, 1963, Apr 9, 1963, all ANYP; SEAN McBRIDE, "Roman Rule?," *Irish Press*, Dublin, Apr 12, 1986.

⁹⁶ Magennis to Wessels, NY, June 6, [1927], CG, Generali 2, AO.

⁹⁷ Magennis to [Franco], The Bronx, July 13, 1927.

⁹⁸ New York Times, July 30, 1927.

Only observant and capable men were to be stationed at Saint Albert's College in Middletown, NY. The fathers were to open a high school in Tarrytown. All fathers were to be in the church for confessions at the Manhattan Church 4:00 to 6:00 PM and from 7:00 to 10:00; one was to be in the church from 6:30 PM to 8:00 PM. The fathers in Bellevue Hospital were to avoid unnecessary conversation with nurses, "Especially anything like familiarity." All was not negative. Magennis praised the office recitation in common, the work of the Little Flower Society and self sacrifice.⁹⁹

Magennis came to the United State early in 1928 and left that August with Lawrence Flanagan, the commissary general, for the Eucharistic Congress in Australia. They returned to America in October. The many crossings of the Atlantic by Magennis served another purpose. He carried messages from the Irish of his persuasion to Connie Neenan and Joseph McGarrity two De Valera supporters in the United States Magennis was still in the United States that fall. He told of how the college in Middletown had an almost completed new building. He described it as "magnificent" and was to be named O'Connor Hall after his late friend. Charles Ronayne was in charge of the college and the better of the father's professors. Peter Magennis preached at the twenty-first anniversary of Marymount Tarrytown and attended a performance of "The Gondoliers" by the college's Dramatic Society. Description of the state of the college's Dramatic Society.

Peter Magennis planned a visitation of the commissariat and said he was going to do something of the first importance. It was a question of ownership. ¹⁰⁴ The visitation did not take place until 1929. The report of the visitation contains nothing about ownership. It is four pages long in Magennis' hand. It begins with a pep talk on observance, following the Rule and continuing the traditions of the order. Choir, morning meditation and other prayers were of strict obligation. Vacation was allowed each year except for the occasion of an European trip. Then one must give up vacation the year before and after. Superiors were to lock the doors at 10:30 PM. There was to be

⁹⁹ Visitation Report, Aug 16, 1927, ANYP.

Magennis to Prior, The Bronx, Mar 11, 1928; same to same, Aug 10, Sept 4, Sept 16, CG. Generali 2, AO.

¹⁰¹ Neenan to O'Callaghan, NY, Oct 20, Nov 17, Nov 24, ANYP.

 $^{^{102}}$ Magennis to [Franco], The Bronx, Nov 23, 1928. Same to same, The Bronx, Nov 29, 1928 repeats the same message.

¹⁰³ New York Times, Dec 9, 1928.

¹⁰⁴ Magennis to [Franco], The Bronx, Dec 10, 1928, CG, Generali 2, AO.

a theological discussion once a week and a house meeting every two weeks. The final injunction was that all should keep a curb on their tongues. If idle gossip continued, it would be better that the commissariate was never founded. 105 Magennis came again in 1930 to the United States but we have no record of any of his activities. 106 At the start of 1931, he was in the United States and sought an interview with Patrick Cardinal Haves, the Archbishop of New York. 107 Magennis did another visitation of at the New York houses. Perhaps it was the establishment of the houses into a province on March 24, 1931 that prompted this. The visitations were conducted in April and the report was issued May 25, 1931. Every house was to have rise at 5:45AM and presence in chapel at 6:00 AM when the Small Hours were recited, followed by points for meditation and a half hour in this exercise. Everyone was to be home by 10:00 PM and in bed by 10:20 PM.¹⁰⁸ Magennis was present at the Marymount Tarrytown graduation and pronounced the benediction.¹⁰⁹

The order's general chapter took place at Rome in October, 1931. Magennis would not go forward for another term and Hilary Doswald was elected his successor. By his own choice, Peter Magennis came to the United States and took up residence at Saint Simon Stock in The Bronx. He had also been invited by the provincial, Lawrence D. Flanagan, with the intent that Magennis would seek new houses for the province. He was very content hearing confessions in three convents and giving conferences in some others. Magennis saw Cardinal Hayes again in 1932. He must have been planning some travel that year as Lawrence Flanagan issued him a *celebret*, a document needed in those days for the celebration of Mass in places other than one's residence. Magennis again went to visit Cardinal Hayes.

¹⁰⁵ Visitation Report, 1929, ANYP.

¹⁰⁶ Magennis to [Franco], Dublin, Aug 15, 1930, CG, Generali 2, AO.

¹⁰⁷ Flanagan to Donohue, The Bronx, Jan 5, 1931, Archives Archdiocese of New York (AANY).

^{108 &}quot;General's Visitation," April, 1931, ANYP.

¹⁰⁹ New York Times, June 1, 1931.

 $^{^{110}\,}$ Magennis to [Franco], Dublin, (?); same to same, The Bronx, Nov 3, (1932?), both CG, Generali 2, AO.

¹¹¹ Donohue to Flanagan, NY, Jan 8, 1932, AANY.

¹¹² Apr 7, 1932, The Bronx, ANYP.

Magennis to Casey, Tarrytown, [April], 1933; Secretary to Magennis, NY, Apr 24, 1933, copy, both in AANY.

At Convent Station, NJ, probably giving a retreat, Magennis wrote Antonio Franco, procurator general of the order, that Lawrence Flanagan expected a lot of help. He had the American idea of the men obtaining degrees in America for teaching in schools. Flanagan was not happy with Roman instruction. He, like the Most Pure Heart of Mary Province, preferred the American way. He made the point that Kilian Lynch at Marymount College made more in salary than the total of all the Masses received by the commissariate in its early days. Magennis was on his way to Chicago for a retreat and commented that he would rather write than preach. He commented on the growth in numbers. Where there had been three in Saint Simon Stock, there were now nine; two in Tarrytown had grown to five. Flanagan wanted another foundation but only one for four fathers so office could be recited in common. Magennis looked on this as not an easy task.¹¹⁴

Magennis was trying to obtain a foundation in Brooklyn. He wrote Antonio Franco that when Msgr. Patrick Cherry of Brooklyn came to Rome to obtain for him a papal audience. Magennis called Cherry a friend who wanted a Carmelite house in Brooklyn. Magennis had dined with Bishop Malloy of Brooklyn at Cherry's rectory and the bishop said he wanted to wait a while for a house so Magennis saw hope there. Magennis was to go to Chicago to give a retreat for priests and students and had the same scheduled later in Middletown. He would be "priest occupied" until the end of August and then he wanted to write a life of Elias.¹¹⁵

Peter Elias Magennis had been out to California to see Bishop John Cantwell of Los Angeles in the fall of 1933. Shortly afterwards, Cantwell came to the Bronx to see Flanagan and offered him a place in Los Angeles. This new house was a credit to Magennis. He was at Marymount Tarrytown on March 19 for the feast of Saint Joseph and the name day of Mother Joseph Butler, the college founder. Magennis had secured permission from Cardinal Hayes to use the library at Saint Joseph's Seminary, Yonkers. He wrote the Cardinal's secretary to thank Hayes. Magennis had used the library some and would use it more when he returned from Europe. When Magennis' volume was finished, he would send Hayes a copy. 118

¹¹⁴ Same to same, Tarrytown, May 13, 1933, CG, Generali 2, AO.

¹¹⁵ Magennis to Franco, Tarrytown, June 26, 1933, CG, Generali 2, AO.

¹¹⁶ Flanagan to Cantwell, The Bronx, Dec 16, 1933, ANYP; McNichols to Doswald, Los Angeles, Jan 2, 1934, CG, Am Sti Eliae (1922-38), AO.

¹¹⁷ New York Times, Mar 20, 1934.

¹¹⁸ Magennis to Casey, Tarrytown, Apr 25, 1934, AANY.

Magennis felt that he had obtained a foundation in Los Angeles and another in Brooklyn in future time. Flanagan had invited him to come for this purpose. At the start of 1934, Peter Magennis felt the work he had come to do was completed and decided to return to Ireland. Young priests, educated in Rome in Magennis time there, were living at Saint Simon Stock, The Bronx. At table, they would speak to Magennis in Italian, a language Provincial Flanagan did not understand. One of those priests, Berthold Forrester, felt that this upset of Flanagan caused him not to treat Magennis so well. Feeling less than welcome, he returned home. 119

Peter Elias Magennis so loved America that he became an American citizen. He came here whenever he could and stayed as long as his time allowed. He often spoke of how the Irish always fought for the Unite States in its wars. Especially did he speak of the American Revolution which dissolved its connection with England. He was wont to mention early battles in the Revolution which England did not decisively win: Bunker Hill, Lexington and Concord. While other Carmelites participated in the Irish Freedom Movement, he was the leader and seemingly the one preferred by people to listen to. Magennis was unyielding, while in the United States, in his pursuit of Irish freedom as he was as general of the Carmelites in their religious observance

† Alfred Isacsson, O.Carm.

¹¹⁹ Oral testimony, numerous times, 1980's.