COMMENTARIOLA

THE OFFICE OF ST. ANNE IN THE CARMELITE LITURGY

In the introduction to their book on the cult of St. Anne, Kathleen Ashley and Pamela Sheingorn¹ offer an extensive description and discussion of a late fifteenth-century altarpiece commissioned by a brotherhood of St. Anne for the Carmelite church in Frankfurt, which gives a comprehensive pictorial overview of devotion to St. Anne among the Carmelites. This artistic depiction of St. Anne's life, including her relationship to the Carmelites, invites a further investigation of her cult and the chants which were used to celebrate her feast in surviving Carmelite manuscripts from Mainz, Germany, and Krakow, Poland.

Since the Carmelites were founded as a group of hermits on Mount Carmel at the end of the twelfth or beginning of the thirteenth century, receiving their rule from the local patriarch Albert of Jerusalem between 1206 and 1214,² their early observance of Mass followed the rite of the Holy Sepulchre,³ while they recited the psalms

¹ Interpreting Cultural Symbols, Saint Anne in Late Medieval Society, edited by KATHLEEN ASHLEY and PAMELA SHEINGORN, The University of Georgia Press, Athens - London 1990; the question of St. Anne and the Carmelites is discussed in detail in their "Introduction", pp. 1-68.

² Albert became Patriarch of Jerusalem in 1206 and was assassinated in 1214, so that the original rule was given to the Carmelites sometime during his term in office; cf. V. L. BULLOUGH, "Albert of Jerusalem, St", in *New Catholic Encyclopedia* I, 258; cf. also, ADRIANO STARING, "Alberto, patriarca di Gerusalleme, santo", in *Bibliotheca Sanctorum* I, cols. 686-90. A good edition of the rule is that of HUGH CLARKE, O. Carm. and BEDE EDWARDS, O.C.D., eds., *The Rule of Saint Albert*, Vinea Carmeli I, Aylesford - Kensington 1973. The rule is discussed in detail in CARLO CICCONETTI, O. Carm., *La Regola del Carmelo*, Institutum Carmelitanum, Roma 1973.

³ HUGO BUCHTHAL, *Miniature Painting in the Latin Kingdom of Jerusalem*, Clarendon Press, Oxford 1957, contains a section on the liturgy of the Holy Sepulchre done by Francis Wormald. For a discussion of the church itself, cf. CHARLES COUASNON, O.P., *The Church of the Holy Sepulchre in Jerusalem*, translated by J.-P. B. and Claude Ross, The Schweich Lectures of the British Academy, 1972, Oxford University Press, London 1974.

privately in the cell rather than chanting the Divine Office in common. Once the Carmelites embraced the mendicant way of life with the revision of the Albertine rule in 1247,⁴ they observed the rite of the Holy Sepulchre for the Divine Office as well, gradually creating a proper Carmelite rite as they incorporated new feasts into their liturgical tradition.

The veneration of St. Anne among the Carmelites closely relates to the veneration of Holy Land persons as saints within the Order's liturgical tradition,⁵ a distinctive feature of their liturgy from its inception. Following the custom of the Holy Sepulchre liturgy, the Carmelites from their earliest days honored the Hebrew patriarchs Abraham, Isaac and Jacob as saints in their own tradition, along with bishops of Jerusalem such as Simeon, and people mentioned in Gospel accounts such as Zacchaeus, whom Jesus coaxed down from a tree to be his dinner companion in Lk 19:5. Thus, the veneration of St. Anne in the Carmelite liturgy logically derives from this impetus to honor liturgically saints associated with the Holy Land.

The second reason for venerating St. Anne is her status as mother of the Virgin Mary. From the earliest settlement on Mount Carmel the first hermits honored the Virgin Mary as the lady of the place;⁶ as their liturgy became formalized, the Carmelites venerated Mary liturgically, observing all the established feasts in her honor and progressively introducing newer ones into their rite, such as Our Lady of the Snows,

⁴ The mitigated text of the Albertine Rule was promulgated by the Apostolic Letter "Quae honorem conditoris", by Innocent IV on October 1, 1247, and is found in the Vatican Archives, Reg. Vat., no. 21, folios 465v-466. It has been edited by M.-H. LAU-RENT, O.P., *La lettre 'Quae honorem Conditoris' (1er octobre, 1247): Note de diplomatique pontificale*, in "Ephemerides Carmeliticae" 2 (1948), pp. 5-16. Cf. also my article *From Rule to Rubric: The Impact of Carmelite Liturgical Legislation upon the Order's Office Tradition*, in "Ephemerides Liturgicae" 108 (1994), pp. 262-298, now chapter 6 of *Praising God in Carmel, Studies in Carmelite Liturgy*, The Carmelite Institute, Washington, D.C. 1999, pp. 180-230.

⁵ For a discussion of the Carmelite Office liturgy, cf. my article, *The Medieval Carmelite Office Tradition*, in "Acta Musicologica" 62 (1990), pp. 119-151, now chapter 7 of *Praising God in Carmel*, pp. 231-278.

⁶ For a discussion of the liturgical veneration of Mary among the Carmelites, cf. my articles, *Chants, Feasts and Traditions: The Liturgical Celebration of the Virgin Mary in the Carmelite Rite,* in DONALD W. BUGGERT, O. Carm., LOUIS P. ROGGE, O. Carm. and MICHAEL J. WASTAG, O. Carm., eds., *Mother, Behold Your Son, Essays in Honor of Eamon R. Carroll, O. Carm.,* The Carmelite Institute, Washington, D.C. 2001, pp. 137-158; and *The Virgin Mary in the Medieval Carmelite Liturgy,* in *Carmel and Mary, Theology and History of the Devotion,* edited by JOHN F. WELCH, O. Carm., The Carmelite Institute, Washington, D.C. 2002, pp. 143-163.

the Presentation and Visitation, all accepted into the liturgy by the General Chapter of Frankfurt in 1393.⁷ The closely related feast of the Three Marys, honoring Mary Cleophas and Mary Salome, the sisters of the Virgin Mary, was accepted into the liturgy by the General Chapter of Lyons in 1342⁸ and enjoyed universal celebration throughout the order after that date. The feast of St. Anne thus figures prominently within the framework of these closely related Marian feasts.

While the Carmelites may have observed a standardized liturgy as soon as they became mendicants in the middle of the thirteenth century, the first document attesting to such a standardization is known as the ordinal of Sibert de Beka, promulgated for universal observance within the order by the General Chapter of London of 1312.⁹ This medieval ordinal stipulated the textual incipits of all the prayers, chants, psalms and readings to be used for the celebration of the Divine Office and most of those to be used for Mass every day. Surviving chant manuscripts from Florence, Mainz, Pisa and Krakow¹⁰

⁷ FR. GABRIEL WESSELS, O. Carm., ed., *Acta Capitulorum Generalium Ordinis Fratrum B. V. Mariae de Monte Carmelo*, I Apud Curiam Generalitiam, Romae 1912, p. 154.

⁸ R. P. BENEDICTUS ZIMMERMAN, O.C.D., *Monumenta Historica Carmelitana*, I, Ex Typis Abbatiae, Lirinae 1907, p. 141. Two versions of this Carmelite office have been edited in my article *The Office of the Three Marys in the Carmelite Liturgy*, in "Journal of the Plainsong & Mediaeval Music Society", 12 (1989), pp. 1-38.

⁹ R. P. BENEDICT ZIMMERMAN, O.C.D., ed., Ordinaire de l'ordre de Notre-Dame du Mont-Carmel par Sibert de Beka (vers 1312) publié d'après le manuscript original et collationné sur divers manuscrits et imprimés, in "Bibliothèque liturgique", 13, Alphonse Picard et fils, Libraires, Paris 1910. An earlier, late thirteenth-century ordinal, now Dublin, Trinity College Library, ms. 194, is almost identical to that of Sibert de Beka and may have served as a model for it, but its usage was probably restricted to England and Ireland rather than being promulgated for observance in the Order as a whole; it has been edited by PATRICK DE SAINT-JOSEPH RUSHE, Antiquum Ordinis Carmelitarum Ordinale, Saec. XIII, in "Études Carmélitaines", 2 (1912-1913), pp. 5-251.

¹⁰ I discuss the Mainz Carmelite manuscripts in *The Carmelite Choirbooks of Mainz and the Liturgical Tradition of the Carmelite Order*, chapter 3 of *Praising God in Carmel*, pp. 71-114; the article originally appeared as *Die Mainzer Karmeliterchorbücher und die Liturgische Tradition des Karmeliterordens*, in "Archiv für mittelrheinische Kirchengeschichte", 39 (1987), pp. 267-303. For the Florence choirbooks, cf. chapter 4 of *Praising God in Carmel*, *The Carmelite Choirbooks of Florence and the Liturgical Tradition of the Carmelite Order*, pp. 115-150; it originally appeared in "Carmelus", 35 (1988), pp. 67-93. Chapter 6 of *Praising God in Carmel* discusses the Pisa codices: *Two Antiphonals of Pisa: Their Place in the Carmelite Liturgy*, pp. 151-179, an article originally published in "Manuscripta", 31 (1987), pp. 147-165. For a preliminary study of the Krakow Carmelite manuscripts, cf. my article, *The Carmelite Choir Books of Krakow: Carmelite Liturgy before and after the Council of Trent*, in "Studia Musicologica Academiae Scientiarum Hungaricae", 45 (2004), pp. 17-34, as well as JERZY GOLOS, *Muzykalia Biblioteki Klasztoru Karmelitów na Piasku w Krakowie*, in "Muzyka", 11 (1966), pp. 86-97.

demonstrate that what was prescribed by Sibert's ordinal was in fact carried out in liturgical practice. Uniformity of text was not accompanied by a uniform musical tradition, as was the case with the Dominicans, however, and no liturgical exemplar comparable to the codex of the Dominican General Humbert of Romans¹¹ was ever produced for the Carmelites. As a result, the Carmelite rite preserved standardized liturgical texts with no attempt to standardize the music, leading in many cases to an interesting variety of chants for the same text within the tradition.

Sibert's Ordinal of 1312 included the feast of St. Anne, indicating that the Carmelites venerated her at the earliest stage of their uniform liturgy. The ordinal prescribed the feast to be observed as a duplex, with the Matins readings being taken from "aliqua propria legenda vel de sermone" [i.e., "any proper readings or from the sermon"], while all the other chants were to derive from the common of a holy woman (*matrona*).¹² The ordinal thus allowed more latitude for the celebration of St. Anne than for most other feasts in the Carmelite rite. Devotion to St. Anne within the order increased progressively, so that the general chapter of 1375 prescribed a commemorative prayer in her honor to be said after that of the Virgin Mary herself.¹³ The chapter of 1387 made this more precise, prescribing that the antiphons *Anna matrona* and *Anna parens* be prayed every day at Matins and Vespers respectively.¹⁴

Sibert's ordinal was held in such respect that it was never emended or updated for subsequent use. For instance, the feast of the Three Marys, accepted into the liturgy in 1342, is found in an antiphonary, or choir book with chants for the Divine Office, now identified as Mainz, Dom- und Diözesanmuseum, Codex E, and in a comparable choir book from Florence, now known as Florence, Carmine, Ms. O, each with a distinctive version of the rhymed office "Hec est

¹¹ The manuscripts known as the Codex of Humbert of Romans containing the complete service books for the Dominican liturgy is preserved in the Dominican convent of Santa Sabina, Rome, Curia Generalizia dei Domenicani, ms. XIV, lit. 1; the portable copy used by the Master General to correct the service books in the convents he visited is now London, British Library, Additional ms. 23935. Cf. WILLIAM R. BONNI-WELL, O.P., *A History of the Dominican Liturgy, 1215-1945*, Joseph F. Wagner, Inc., New York 1945, especially pp. 83-97, for this discussion.

¹² ZIMMERMAN, Ordinaire, p. 236.

¹³ WESSELS, Acta Capitulorum Generalium, I, p. 75.

¹⁴ *Ibidem*, p. 102.

dies gloriosa."¹⁵ A copy of Sibert's Ordinal from Dijon from the year 1468 still makes no reference within the ordinal itself to this newer feast, although it is mentioned elsewhere.¹⁶ As a result, more latitude evidently prevailed in celebrating feasts which entered the rite later rather than earlier, so that feasts such as St. Anne were prescribed only in general terms in Sibert's ordinal and were never rendered more precise later on. Thus a printed breviary from Venice from 1495 uses identical terminology, "lectiones de aliqua propria legenda vel sermone," as the ordinal itself to describe this feast.¹⁷

The feast of St. Anne, like the feasts of the Three Marys and the Presentation of the Virgin, derived from the apocryphal *Protoevangelium Jacobi*, or Infancy Gospel of James, now dated to around the year 150 C. E.¹⁸ The story was also popularized in the *Legenda Aurea* of Jacob of Voragine, among other popular works of the later middle ages.¹⁹ Sherry Reames, in discussing the office of St. Anne from the 14th-century Stowe breviary (London, British Library, ms. Stowe 12), points out that the celebration of a feast of St. Anne only was extended to most of England in 1382 and to the Church as a whole in 1584.²⁰ The presence of the feast in Sibert de Beka's Ordinal of

¹⁵ These two versions of the office of the Three Marys have been edited in my article, *The Office of the Three Marys in the Carmelite Liturgy*, in "Journal of the Plainsong & Mediaeval Music Society", 12 (1989), pp. 1-38.

¹⁶ The manuscript, Dijon, Bibliothèque municipale, ms. 121, a French Carmelite ordinal from 1468, includes the liturgical prescriptions from the chapters of Montpellier [1369], Frankfurt [1393] and Paris [1456] for the feast, but not the texts themselves. Cf. my article, *From Rule to Rubric: The Impact of Carmelite Liturgical Legislation upon the Order's Office Tradition*, in *Praising God in Carmel*, pp. 180-230, especially p. 219, for this discussion.

¹⁷ PASCHALIS KALLENBERG, O. Carm. discusses this printed breviary in *Fontes Liturgiae Carmelitanae, Investigatio in Decreta, Codices et Proprium Sanctorum,* Institutum Carmelitanum, Romae 1962, p. 262. The breviary was printed in Venice by Andreas de Torresanis de Asula on 1 February 1495. A copy of this incunable breviary which was originally used in the Carmelite convent of Bamberg is now in the library of Amherst College, with the shelf-mark xRBR Incun 1495 B7. The feast of St. Anne occurs on f. 300 in this breviary.

¹⁸ Cf. The Infancy Gospel of James (Protoevangelium Jacobi) (The Birth of Mary), in The Other Bible, Jewish Pseudepigrapha, Christian Apocrypha, Gnostic Scriptures, Kabbalah, Dead Sea Scrolls, Edited with Introductions by WILLIS BARNSTONE, HarperCollins Publishers, New York 1984, pp. 383-392.

¹⁹ Ashley-Sheingorn, p. 17.

²⁰ SHERRY REAMES, Origins and Affiliations of the Pre-Sarum Office for Anne in the Stowe Breviary, in Music and Medieval Manuscripts, Paleography and Performance, Essays dedicated to Andrew Hughes, edited by JOHN HAINES and RANDALL ROSENFELD, Ashgate Publishing Limited, Aldershot 2004, p. 350.

1312 is therefore noteworthy, even though devotion to St. Anne was also prominent in many other centers in Europe before its official papal promulgation.

Since the prescriptions for celebrating the feast were rather general in Sibert's Ordinal, much latitude prevailed in its liturgical organization in extant Carmelite antiphonaries and breviaries. Thus the printed Venice breviary of 1495 contains a complete series of readings based on the Gospel of James, but with no prescriptions for the chants to be done in the office. A breviary from Mainz, now New Haven, Yale University Library, ms. 41 (John W. Sterling 80) repeats the "aliqua legenda" stipulation of Sibert's Ordinal, but has a completely different series of texts than the 1495 breviary, also with no indication of the chants to be used.²¹ Fourteenth-century antiphonaries from Pisa and Florence contain no specific chants for the celebration of the feast, so that presumably they were all taken from the common of a holy woman as Sibert's Ordinal prescribed. Only in Carmelite manuscripts from Krakow (Poland) and Mainz (Germany) do we find a complete office for St. Anne. The earliest Krakow manuscripts date to approximately 1397, roughly contemporaneous with the Florentine ones, and contain a complete rhymed office for the feast, while the Florence ones do not.

The choir books containing chants for the Divine Office, manuscripts Krakow, Carmelite Convent codex 1 (Rkp. perg. 12) and codex 3 (Rkp. 15)²² contain the rhymed office for St. Anne, beginning with the text "Gaude Syon filie laudantes" as the first antiphon for first Vespers. This is a completely different office from the version in Mainz, Dom- und Diözesanmuseum, Codex C, which begins with the text

²¹ This manuscript is described in BARBARA SHAILOR, *Catalogue of Medieval and Renaissance Manuscripts in the Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library, Yale University* (Center for Medieval and Renaissance Texts and Studies 34), New York 1984, I, pp. 70-71; SEYMOUR DE RICCI, *Census of Medieval and Renaissance Manuscripts in the United States and Canada*, New York 1935-37, I, p. 370; and PASCHALIS KALLENBERG, O. Carm., *Fontes Liturgiae Carmelitanae*, pp. 164-167.

²² JERZY GOLOS, in his article *Muzikalia Biblioteki Klasztoru Karmelitów na Piaschu w Krakowie*, in "Muzyka", 11 (1966), pp. 86-97, as well as in a handlist in the Krakow archive, numbered the manuscripts according to size from the largest to the smallest, using the term Rkp. for "rekopis", the abbreviation for the Polish word for "manuscript", to designate them. In my article *The Carmelite Choir Books of Krakow: Carmelite Liturgy before and after the Council of Trent*, in "Studia Musicologica Academiae Scientiarum Hungaricae", 45 (2004), pp. 17-34, I ordered them chronologically from earliest to latest. Thus I designate the manuscripts with my number as ms.number and Golos's number as Rkp.

"Celeste beneficium introivit" as the first antiphon for first Vespers.²³ The Krakow version is consistent between Codex 1 and Codex 3, but the office in Codex 3 is more complete and, unlike that of Codex 1. was never emended for subsequent use after the Council of Trent. Krakow manuscripts 1 and 2, along with a third choir book which is now housed in the Biblioteka Narodowa "Ossolineum" of Wroclaw, ms. [rkps] 12025/IV,²⁴ were produced in Prague and brought to Krakow for the foundation of the new convent in 1397. Codex 3, a manuscript dated to 1468, includes the closely related feast of the Three Marys, the third example of this feast in Carmelite antiphonals, complementing the other two offices in the Mainz and Florence manuscripts.²⁵ The Krakow manuscripts also include the Bohemian feasts of Sts. Wenceslaus and Ludmilla,26 not otherwise known in the Carmelite liturgical tradition, suggesting that the Prague Carmelites who produced the codices allowed greater latitude in their liturgical practices than did their more western counterparts, despite the close ties they maintained with the Upper German province, of which they formed a part.27

Ashley and Sheingorn trace the story of Anne and her *trinubium* or three marriages to the 9th-century biblical commentator Haymo of Auxerre in his *Historiae sacrae epitome*.²⁸ According to this story, Anne was married first to Joachim, by whom she had Mary, the mother of Jesus, then after Joachim's death to Cleophas, by whom she had

²³ The chants for the feast of St. Anne begin on fò 117 in Krakow, Carmelite Convent, ms. 3 and on f. 226 in Mainz, Dom- und Diözesanmuseum Codex C. The Mainz version has been edited in BOYCE, *Cantica Carmelitana: The Chants of the Carmelite Office* 2 (Ph.D. Dissertation, New York University, 1984), pp. 126-153.

²⁴ The manuscript is described in *Inwentarz Rekopiisów Biblioteki Zakladu Narodowego im Ossolinskich we Wroclawiu*, Tom III, Recopisy 11981-13000, opracowaly i przygotowaly do druku Amelia Dician i Janina Loret-Heintsch pod redakcja Adama Fastnachta (Wroclaz, Warsawa, Kraków, Zadlad Narodowy Imienia Ossoliinskich Wydawnictwo Polskiej Akademii Nauk, 1966), pp. 24-25.

²⁵ The Mainz and Florence versions of this office have been edited in my article *The Office of the Three Marys in the Carmelite Liturgy*, in "Journal of the Plainsong & Mediaeval Music Society", 12 (1989), pp. 1-38.

²⁶ The office of St. Ludmilla is the same version as that edited by DOMINIQUE PATIER, *L'office rythmique de Sainte Ludmila*, in "Études Grégoriennes", 21 (1986), pp. 49-96.

²⁷ For a discussion of the foundation of the Carmelite convent of Krakow, cf. TADEUSZ M. TRAJDOS, *Fundacja Klasztoru Karmelitów Trzewiczkowych na Piasku w Krakowie* ("The foundation of the monastery of the Carmelites Antiquae Observantiae in Cracow"), in "Naza Przeszlosc", 60 (1983), pp. 91-127.

²⁸ Ashley - Sheingorn, p. 11.

another Mary and then after Cleophas' death to Salome, by whom she had a third Mary. The intermingling of feasts became more complex, since Mary Salome was identified in Church tradition as the mother of James and John, sons of Zebedee, and therefore herself the wife of Zebedee.²⁹ The James in question is the famous saint whose shrine is at Compostela in Spain, a town which also has a church dedicated to St. Mary Salome not far from the cathedral. The offspring of the marriages of the three Marys were understood as the cousins to Jesus who were interpreted as the brothers referred to in the Gospels, thus safeguarding the perpetual virginity of Mary herself. This may be the reason why the Carmelites, Dominicans and Franciscans all defended the trinubium during the later middle ages.³⁰ The Carmelite chronicler Jean de Venette wrote a history of the Three Marys,³¹ which relates closely to the Provencal devotion which the Carmelites adopted into their own liturgy in 1342 at the chapter of Lyons, which Jean de Venette would have attended in his capacity as provincial of France.³²

If the Gospel of James expanded upon the scriptural references to the Virgin Mary, confined to the Gospels of Matthew and Luke, by illustrating the infancy of the Virgin as well as the lives of her parents, Joachim and Anne, the Carmelites in the fourteenth century were busy expanding upon and even creating their own history as well. While the original Carmelites sought to emulate the prophet Elijah by the manner of their life in the very place where Elijah had once exercised his ministry, their successors described Elijah's influence upon them in a document known as the *rubrica prima* of the Constitutions of 1281:

We declare, bearing testimony to the truth, that from the time when the prophets Elijah and Elisha dwelt devoutly on Mount Carmel, holy Fathers both of the Old and the New Testament, whom the contemplation of heavenly things drew to the solitude of the same mountain, have without doubt led praiseworthy lives there by the fountain of Elijah in holy penitence unceasingly and successfully maintained.

²⁹ Ibidem, p. 12.

³⁰ ANDREW JOTISCHKY, *The Carmelites and Antiquity. Mendicants and their Pasts in the Middle Ages*, Oxford University Press, Oxford 2002, p. 226, fn. 50.

³¹ For a discussion on the Carmelite chronicler Jean de Venette and his story of the Three Marys, cf. MICHAEL T. DRISCOLL, O. Carm., *"L'histoire des Trois Maries" by Jean de Venette, O. Carm.*, in "Cahiers de Joséphologie", 23 (1975), pp. 231-254; ALFRED COVILLE, *Jean de Venette, auteur de l'Histoire des Trois Maries*, in "Histoire Littéraire de la France", 38 (1949), pp. 355-404.

³² MICHAEL T. DRISCOLL, O. Carm., "L'histoire des Trois Maries" by Jean de Venette, O. Carm., p. 235.

It was these same successors whom Albert the patriarch of Jerusalem in the time of Innocent III united into a community, writing a rule for them which Pope Honorius, the successor of the same Innocent, and many of their successors, approving this Order, most devoutly confirmed by their charters. In the profession of this rule we, their followers, serve the Lord in diverse parts of the world, even to the present day.³³

This *rubrica prima* thus indicates that the sacred memory of the presence of Elijah and Elisha on Mount Carmel attracted people to the site as a place of contemplation; it also identifies the site of Elijah's fountain as the specific area on Mount Carmel where they settled. This declaration also includes the Carmelites to whom Albert gave the rule in the long line of holy people who had embraced the eremitical life on Mount Carmel. In fact, Elias Friedman referred to the original Carmelites as Latin hermits to distinguish them from Greek Orthodox and others who had established themselves there and who coexisted with the first Carmelites.³⁴

By the fourteenth century, however, Carmelite references to Elijah amplified the *rubrica prima*, describing his spiritual influence upon the order, and sought to identify him as their founder. Thus they came to identify the sons of the prophets whom Elijah gathered around him with the Carmelites themselves and used some rather tenuous scriptural interpretations to arrive at the conclusion that Elijah the prophet had directly founded the Carmelites. John Baconthorpe, the four-teenth-century Carmelite scholar who at one time served as provincial of England, sought to establish a link between Elijah and the Virgin Mary. In chapter 1 of his *Speculum de Institutione* he maintained that the Carmelites were founded for the specific purpose of honoring the Virgin Mary³⁵ and that Elijah and his prophetic sons themselves rendered devotion to Mary on Mount Carmel.³⁶

³³ JOACHIM SMET, O. Carm., *The Carmelites, A History of the Brothers of Our Lady of Mount Carmel, Volume I, Ca. 1200 Until the Council of Trent, Revised Edition, Carmelite Spiritual Center, Darien, Illinois 1988, pp. 15-16.*

³⁴ ELIAS FRIEDMAN, *The Latin Hermits of Mount Carmel, A Study in Carmelite Origins*, Institutum Historicum Teresianum, Roma 1979.

³⁵ "Fratres Carmeli specialiter originem habuerunt pro veneratione Beatae Mariae"; cited in P. RUDOLF HENDRIKS, O. Carm., *La succession héréditaire (1280-1451)*, in "Études Carmélitaines" ("Élie le prophète", vol. 2), XX (1956), p. 42.

³⁶ P. RUDOLF HENDRIKS, O. Carm., La succession héréditaire (1280-1451), p. 42.

Around 1370 the Catalan Carmelite Philippe Ribot wrote his *Institution of the First Monks*,³⁷ a retelling and amplification of these ideas in story form which held enormous influence over the way Carmelites viewed themselves throughout the later middle ages. Carmelite efforts to strengthen their spiritual ties with Elijah the prophet paralleled the desire to strengthen their bonds with the Virgin Mary as well. Thus the Constitutions of 1324 expanded upon the *rubrica prima* to maintain that the original Carmelite hermits, successors to Elijah after the incarnation, dedicated their church to Mary.³⁸

With the progressive interest in and devotion to St. Anne in the later Middle Ages, it was relatively easy for later Carmelite writers to incorporate her into the relationship between the Carmelite sons of the prophets and the Virgin Mary. Andrew Jotischky also mentions that the idea that the "house of St. Anne" in Jerusalem was a Carmelite priory is found in the Universis christifidelibus of the 1290s and quoted by the Carmelite writers Jean de Cheminot and John of Hildesheim.³⁹ In their introduction, Ashley and Sheingorn maintain that the Carmelites were the first of the orders to observe the feast of St. Anne in the thirteenth century,⁴⁰ perhaps because it is mentioned in a late 13th-century ordinal now in the library of Trinity College, Dublin.⁴¹ Carmelite observance of this feast would only have become universal, however, with the promulgation of Sibert's ordinal in 1312. Jotischky also maintains that later Carmelites were interested in Saint Anne: thus the English Carmelite John Bale copied out a History of Saint Anne in one of his travel notebooks, (now London, British Library, ms. Harley 1819) ostensibly from a fifth century work by Cyril of Alexandria, but clearly one of his own inventions.⁴² Carmelite writer Arnold Bostius (d. 1499), in his Speculum Historiale, wrote of Anne's mother Emerentia seeking advice from the Carmelites concerning her mar-

³⁷ For a brief discussion of Philippe Ribot and his work, cf. ADRIANUS STARING, O. Carm., *Medieval Carmelite Heritage*, Institutum Carmelitanum, Roma 1989, especially pp. 11-12.

³⁸ The text reads: "quorum successores post incarnacionem Christi ibidem iuxta fontem Helie ecclesiam in honore beate Marie Virginis construxerunt"; quoted in P. RUDOLF HENDRIKS, O. Carm., *La succession héréditaire (1280-1451)*, p. 41.

³⁹ ANDREW JOTISCHKY, *The Carmelites and Antiquity*, p. 226.

⁴⁰ ASHLEY - SHEINGOR, p. 21.

⁴¹ This early ordinal is discussed in PASCHALIS KALLENBERG, O. Carm., *Fontes Liturgiae Carmelitanae, Investigatio in Decreta, Codices et Proprium Sanctorum*, pp. 104-105; it has been edited by PATRICK DE SAINT-JOSEPH RUSHE, *Antiquum Ordinis Carmelitarum Ordinale, Saec. XIII*, in "Études Carmélitaines", 2 (1912-1913), pp. 5-251.

⁴² ANDREW JOTISCHKY, The Carmelites and Antiquity, p. 225.

riage.⁴³ Carmelites also cultivated the association with St. Anne in art, such as the Florentine Carmelite Fra Filippo Lippi's panel, now in Bamberg, of St. Anne along with the Carmelite saints Albert and Angelus.⁴⁴ Perhaps they expressed these stories of St. Anne in art rather than in the order's liturgy and music, because such artistic depictions were less subject to the jurisdiction of Church authority than would be the liturgy itself.

In their discussion of the Carmelite altarpiece, Kathleen Ashley and Pamela Sheingorn state: "The outer left wing begins with a scene unique in art: a visit of the Holy Kinship to the Carmelites on Mount Carmel... It is surely meant to embody a vision devoutly wished for by contemporary Carmelites, for the Holy Kinship is represented as the altarpiece at the choir in the background, its stalls filled with Carmelites".⁴⁵ The choir in the background filled with Carmelites could also be a representation of the early chapel on Mount Carmel where the original hermits gathered for Mass and later for Office. Fr. Eamon Carroll, O. Carm. discusses the widely-held tradition of the visit of St. Anne and her relatives to Mount Carmel:

So it was that a young girl by the name of Emerentia visited Mount Carmel in her mother's company. The monks encouraged her to comply with her parents' wishes and marry a devout man, Stellanus. Of their marriage two children were born, Anne and Esmeria. Esmeria continued the custom of visiting Carmel with her own children, one was St. Elizabeth. St. Anne did the same and when Mary was born she sometimes brought her to visit the hermits on the holy mountain.

This was a well-known story at the end of the 15th century, when there was a great interest in St. Anne.⁴⁶

Thus the vision devoutly wished for may also have a basis in these later Carmelite writings which expand upon the network of relationships among the Carmelites, Elijah, Mary and eventually St. Anne.

Table 1 shows the text incipits and modal assignments for the office of St. Anne in Mainz, Codex C, while Table 2 shows the version in Krakow, ms. 3. While their chant texts are entirely different offices, both of these offices have counterparts in various breviaries cited by

⁴³ Ibidem, p. 227.

⁴⁴ *Ibidem*, p. 227.

⁴⁵ ASHLEY - SHEINGORN, p. 35.

⁴⁶ EAMON R. CARROLL, O. Carm., *The Medieval Flowering*, in *Carmel and Mary, Theology and History of the Devotion*, edited by JOHN F. WELCH, O. Carm., The Carmelite Institute, Washington, D.C. 2002, pp. 49-68.

Dreves and Blume in their work, *Analecta Hymnica Medii Aevi*⁴⁷ and in the electronic publication of Andrew Hughes, *Late Medieval Liturgical Offices*.⁴⁸ Given the late date of these offices, one cannot conclude from their occurrence in other sources which one influenced the other, since more than one liturgical tradition could easily have adopted this office at the same time. Many of the Mainz Carmelite pieces coincide with those in a Dominican antiphonary, now Vatican Library, Vat. Lat. 10775.

Sherry Reames has discussed an office for St. Anne in an English Carmelite breviary and fesitye missal written around 1400, now Oxford, University College, Ms. E.9, which is "almost identical with the version in Stowe for Matins, Lauds and Second Vespers".⁴⁹ Her Stowe breviary version of the office is essentially different from this Mainz antiphonal, although the responsory "Inclita stirps Jesse" is common to both. The chant "Celebremus hodiernam" is used as a responsory in the Stowe breviary and as an antiphon in the Mainz Carmelite antiphonal.⁵⁰ The Mainz Carmelite office uses the "Stirps Yesse" responsory originally composed by Fulbert of Chartres for the feast of the Nativity of Mary,51 here appropriating what was once said of the daughter, the Virgin Mary, to apply it now to the mother, St. Anne. Moreover, this same responsory is used for first Vespers, for the first nocturn of Matins and for second Vespers, indicating that it was much appreciated in the Carmelite rite. Within the Carmelite tradition this "Stirps Yesse" melody was given a new text, "Unam quam petii." to be used for the office of the Presentation of Marv found in Mainz, Codex D, one of the very few chants in this newly composed office which was not based on the office of St. Thomas Becket.⁵² The

⁴⁷ DREVES - BLUME, Analecta Hymnica Medii Aevi 25, pp. 52-61.

⁴⁸ ANDREW HUGHES includes twenty-four offices for St. Anne and one for Sts. Joachim and Anne in his *Late Medieval Liturgical Offices*, Resources for electronic research. Vol. I. Texts. *Subsidia mediaevalia* 23 (Toronto, 1994), now available on the Intenet, at <u>http://www.let.uu.nl/cgi-bin/cantus/scripts/LMLO/index.cgi?zoek =Anna&type</u> =XN&resultaten=true, consulted on 15 May 2005.

⁴⁹ SH. REAMES, Origins and Affiliations of the Pre-Sarum Office for Anne in the Stowe Breviary, p. 353.

⁵⁰ Cf. *ibidem*, pp. 359-361, for this discussion.

⁵¹ YVES DELAPORTE, Fulbert de Chartres et l'école chartraine de chant liturgique au XIe siècle, in "Études Grégoriennes", 2 (1957), pp. 51-81; R. DE SAINTE-BEUVE, O.S.B., Les Répons de Saint Fulbert de Chartres pour la Nativité de la Sainte Vierge, in "Revue grégorienne", 13 (1928), pp. 121-128, 157-174.

⁵² I discuss the composition of the Mainz Carmelite office of the Presentation of the Virgin in *The* Carmelite *Feast of the Presentation of the Virgin, A Study in Musical*

use of the same chant melody creates a link among the three feasts of the Nativity of Mary, St. Anne and the Presentation of the Virgin, all of which are closely related anyway. The Krakow Carmelite version of the office applies the melody of "Stirps Yesse" to a new text, "Stirps Aaron", which further indicates that the Carmelites shared in the general respect for Fulbert's text and music.

While most of the pieces in the Mainz Carmelite version of this office have correspondences in the listing of chants in Analecta Hymnica, several do not; furthermore, the liturgical ordering of chants in the Mainz Carmelite version is different from that in the published source of Dreves and Blume. Chant melodies are normally written in one of the eight Church modes, each one defined by the range of its pitches and by the note on which the chant ends. Thus the pitches of mode 1 are d e f g a b c d, with the last note of the chant, known as the final, on d. Similar modes are organized beginning and ending on e, f and g, giving modes 3, 5 and 7. When the range of the \underline{d} mode begins a fourth lower, yielding $\underline{a} \ \underline{b} \ \underline{c} \ \underline{d} \ \underline{e} \ \underline{f} \ \underline{g} \ \underline{a}$ and keeping the final on \underline{d} we call the range "plagal" rather than "authentic": and label the mode 2 rather than 1; thus modes 4, 6 and 8 are the plagal versions of modes 3, 5 and 7, also ending on e, f and g respectively. Our major and minor scales today derive from these modes, the natural minor scale from mode 2 and the major scale from mode 5. Metric or rhymed offices often arrange their antiphons and responsories in numerical order according to mode. Thus the ideal organization of chants has the nine antiphons and responsories of Matins follow a consecutive order of modes one through eight with the ninth one being again in mode one.⁵³ A perusal of the modes as listed in our table 1 illustrates that this prevails only to a limited extent. The use of the mode 2 responsory "Stirps Yesse" as the third responsory is perhaps in deference to Fulbert of Chartres, who composed his three new responsories to conclude each of the three nocturns, that is, the 3rd, 6th and 9th responsories of Matins. Nonetheless it distorts the modal order, since it is in mode 2 rather than in mode 3.

Whereas the Carmelite altarpiece cited earlier directly relates St. Anne to the Carmelites, the liturgical texts are much less specific and

Adaptation, in MARGOT E. FASSLER - REBECCA A. BALTZER, eds., The Divine Office in the Latin Middle Ages: Source Studies, Regional Developments, Hagiography, Writings in Honor of Professor Ruth Steiner, Oxford University Press, New York 2000, pp. 485-518.

⁵³ ANDREW HUGHES discusses the question of the modal ordering of chants in *Modal Order and Disorder in the Rhymed Office*, in "Musica disciplina", 37 (1983), pp. 29-52.

refer to general themes of St. Anne's marriage late in life. Like her Jewish ancestor Hannah, whose Latinized name she bears, Anne remains for many years, in this case, twenty, without child ["sic per annos bis decenos" N2A1] before conceiving the Virgin Mary. The texts here closely relate to the Gospel of James, dealing with the themes of infertility, Anne being from Bethlehem and hence of royal descent, Joachim's shame at being without progeny and their prayers being answered in the birth of Mary. Musically the chants follow the custom of rhymed offices by featuring newly composed music. The most striking aspects of this music are the verses used for the Matins responsories, all of which are newly composed, rather than simply following the prescribed tone for each mode. They normally end on the final of the given mode, that is, \underline{d} , \underline{e} , \underline{f} or \underline{g} , in order to clarify the mode of the piece, something made necessary by the digression from the standard tonal formula for the verse.⁵⁴

Table 2 shows the chants for the Krakow Carmelite office of St. Anne. Ashley and Sheingorn postulate that papal approval for a feast of St. Anne on 21 November 1378 may have been out of deference to Anne, the new queen of Bohemia, meant "as a compliment to her through honoring her name saint".⁵⁵ Possibly this Krakow Carmelite office of St. Anne, compiled in Prague, was written to coincide with the extension of St. Anne's cult at this time.

While the chant texts are entirely different from the Mainz version [and from the English Oxford breviary version], most of them can be identified with another office in honor of St. Anne, also included in Dreves and Blume's *Analecta Hymnica Medii Aevi*⁵⁶ and in Hughes' *Late Medieval Liturgical Offices*. Apart from the Matins antiphons, not included in the *Analecta Hymnica* version, and a few other chants, the Carmelite version has the same chant texts and follows the same order as the published office here. This office emphasizes the *trinubium* by speaking of Anne's three daughters, "Anne tres sunt filie" in 1VA3 and their six other sons [that is, in addition to Jesus], "sex alie natos genuerunt hosque beatos", of N1R3v3; these would be St. James the Lesser, St. Simon, St. Jude and St. Joseph the Just, offspring of Mary,

⁵⁴ I discuss these musical characteristics in *Rhymed Office Responsory Verses: Style Characteristics and Musical Significance*, in *Cantus Planus, Papers Read at the 7th Meeting, Sopron, Hungary, 1995*, Hungarian Academy of Sciences, Institute for Musicology, Budapest 1998, pp. 99-121.

⁵⁵ ASHLEY - SHEINGORN, p. 21.

⁵⁶ DREVES - BLUME, Analecta Hymnica Medii Aevi 25, pp. 58-61.

daughter of Cleophas and wife of Alphaeus, and St. James the Great and St. John the Evangelist, the offspring of St. Mary Salome.⁵⁷ The text of N2R2: "Oriunda ex Bethleem," emphasizes Anne's relationship to the royal city of Bethlehem and, by extension, to the royal line of David, while N1R2, "Stirps Aaron," emphasizes her relationship to the priestly line of Aaron.⁵⁸ The fact that the ordering of chants in the Krakow Carmelite tradition so closely reflects the standardized ordering of pieces in Analecta Hymnica may suggest that the Krakow Carmelites simply adopted this standardized office as a whole into their liturgy while the Mainz Carmelites either adopted their office in a revised form or changed it themselves to make it conform to their own liturgical taste. Musically the Krakow Carmelite office of St. Anne offers an ideal plan of Matins antiphons extending from modes 1 through 8 and then using mode 1 again for the 9th antiphon. The first six Matins responsories also follow a modal order, as do the first four of the five Lauds antiphons.

The Carmelites' celebration of St. Anne in art as depicted in the Frankfurt altarpiece was more than balanced by their celebration of her life in their liturgical tradition. The veneration of the mother of the Virgin Mary was a logical broadening of their devotion to the Virgin Mary herself, extending it back one generation in the family tree even as their celebration of the Three Marys extended the devotion laterally. Their adaptation of the "Stirps Yesse" responsory, originally composed for the Nativity of Mary, into the feast of her mother in the Mainz office, and their ready acceptance of the "Stirps Aaron" counterpart in the Krakow office, allowed them creatively to link mother and daughter by musical and textual inference as well as to pay tribute to the original author of the chant. Fulbert of Chartres. The several references in the Krakow office to the other daughters of St. Anne allowed the Carmelites to interrelate these two feasts honoring the relatives of the Virgin Mary, thereby reinforcing their own veneration of the Virgin Mary, in whose service and imitation they exercised their vocation.

⁵⁷ ALFRED COVILLE, Jean de Venette, auteur de l'Histoire des Trois Maries, in "Histoire Littéraire de la France", 38 (1949), p. 398.

⁵⁸ VIRGINIA NIXON mentions such liturgical attempts to link St. Anne to the royal and priestly houses in *Mary's Mother, Saint Anne in Late Medieval Europe*, The Pennsylvania State University Press, University Park, Pennsylvania 2004), p. 53, and p. 177, fn. 45, citing *Ain gar nutzlichs büchlin von dem ganzen geschlecht sant Anna und von sant Anna lobliche brüderschafft: Vnnd von etlichen grossen wunderzaichen sant Anna*, Augsburg, after 1494, now in the Bayerische Staatsbibliothek in Munich.

If Carmelite writers such as John Baconthorpe, Philippe Ribot, Arnold Bostius and others sought to reinforce the Carmelites' sense of personal identity and history as a religious order, leading eventually to the depiction of St. Anne's visit to the hermits on Mount Carmel in liturgical art, Carmelite celebration of the feast of St. Anne reinforced their unique heritage and sense of communal and personal identity in liturgical texts and music. In the process they celebrated in their liturgy and preserved in their manuscripts two interesting offices in honor of St. Anne which serve as valuable monuments today.

JAMES JOHN BOYCE, O. CARM.

St. John Priory 235 Harrison Street Leonia, NJ. 07605 - 1609 U.S.A.

180

TABLE 1

CHANT INCIPITS AND MODAL ASSIGNMENTS MAINZ, DOM- UND DIÖZESANMUSEUM, CODEX C

<u>Chant</u>	Incipit	Mode
<u>1st Vespers</u>		
IV A R A	Celeste beneficium Stirps Yesse (rubric only) Felix Anna quedam matrona	1
<u>Matins</u>		
Inv	In honore beatissime Anne P. Venite	
N1A1	Apud Dominum hominesque	
A2	P. Domine Dominus noster Substantia nempe	1
112	P. Celi enarrant	2
A3	Peregrinis et egenis P. Domini est terra	2
R1	P. Domini est terra Nazareus pater huius vite	3
R2	v. Dignum enim erat talem Quadam die soli stanti	1
R3	v. Sic dolorem eius gravem Stirps Yesse [rubric only]	2
N2A1	Sic per annos bis decenos P. Eructavit	4
A2	Ea quidem tempestate	
A3	P. Deus noster refugium Exprobrabat et dicebat	5
54	P. Fundamenta	6
R1	Firma fide fidens crede v. Quia Deus vestros pius	4
R2	Preces tue sunt accepte	4
R3	v. Uxor Deo cara concipiet Erant autem circa templum	4
	v. Que et quanta sit futurav. Gloria patri	7

1V = 1st Vespers; A = Antiphon; Inv = Invitatory Antiphon [Psalm 94]; P = Psalm; N = nocturn; R = responsory; v = responsory verse; L = Lauds; 2V = 2nd Vespers; M = Magnificat antiphon [for Vespers]; B = Benedictus antiphon [for Lauds]

182	JAMES JOHN BOYCE	
<u>Chant</u>	Incipit	Mode
N3A1	Non nature sed peccati	
	P. Cantate j.	7
A2	Cum ad portam	
12	P. Dominus regnavit	8
A3	Infecundos cum fecundis P. Cantate ij.	4
R1	Promiserunt et voverunt	4
KI	v. Et mancipaturos	8
R2	Vobis quoque nascituram	0
	v. Vocabitis hanc Mariam	5
R3	Inclita stirps Yesse	
	v. Hec est virga Dei	
	v. Gloria patri	1
<u>Lauds</u>		
L A1	Virgo semper hec Maria	
	P. Dominus regnavit	1
A2	A Nazareth oriunda	
	P. Jubilate	2
A3	Hec Ioachim viro iuncta	
	P. Deus Deus meus	3
A4	Hec ad casam exhinc suam	
	P. Benedicite	4
A5	Ex hoc autem	_
	P. Laudate	5
В	Preces tue sunt accepte	-
and Management	P. Benedictus	7
<u>2nd Vespers</u>		
2V M	Anna parens	
	P. Magnificat	1
R	Stirps Yesse	
	v. Virgo Dei genitrix	
	v. Gloria patri	2
В	O Anna matrona nobilis	/
	P. Benedictus	6

TABLE 2

CHANT INCIPITS AND MODAL ASSIGNMENTS KRAKOW, CARMELITE CONVENT, MS. 3

<u>Chant</u>	<u>Incipit</u>	<u>Mode</u>
<u>1st Vespers</u>		
1VA1	Gaude Syon filie laudantes	
A2	P. Laudate pueri	1
AZ	Anne vita vitans pia P. Euouae	5
A3	Anne tres sunt filie	5
	P. Euouae	5
A4	Templo servientibus de rebus	
	P. Euouae	6
A5	Anna mater cum filia	
_	P. Euouae	6
R	Regnum celi et vite corona	_
м	v. Gloriatur in conspectu	5
М	O rosa vernalis P. Magnificat	5
<u>Matins</u>	P. Magnificat	5
Inv	Diem festum Anne sancte	
1117	P. Venite	1
N1A1	Manum suam Anna misit	1
	P. Domine Dominus	1
A2	Manum suam aperuit	
	P. Celi enarrant	2
A3	Fortitudo et décor	
	P. Domini est terra	3
R1	Anna florens clara prosapia	
	v. Digna quidem celesti	1
R2	Stirps Aaron sanctam [based on Stirps Yesse]	
	v. Prodiit ex Anna	2
R3	Felix domina sublimat	
	v. Sex alie natos	2
	v. Gloria patri	3
N2A1	Os suum aperuit	
	P. Eructavit	4
A2	Consideravit semitas	
	P. Dominus regnavit exultet	5
A3	Date ei de fructu	
	P. Fundamenta	6

JAMES JOHN BOYCE	
Incipit	Mode
Anna nupta Ioachim	
v. Stirpe nobilis virtute	4
Oriunda ex Bethleem	
v. Tam clarum genus	5
Anna floret ut lilium	
v. Gloria patri	6
Ego quasi terebintus	
	7
	r
	8
Beatus venter	
P. Cantate ij.	1
Felix Anna cuius tres filie	
v. Prima gignit regem	4
O mater Anna nobilis	
6 6	5
-	
v. Gloria patri	1
Anna Christi thalamum	
	1
Pulso mentis iubilo	
P. Iubilate	2
Vigilans et sitiens	
P. Deus Deus	3
Benedicant omnia Deum	
	4
	_
	7
	5
	5
	IncipitAnna nupta Ioachim• Stirpe nobilis virtuteOriunda ex Bethleem• Tam clarum genusAnna floret ut Ilium• Tam cum sanctis• Gloria patriEgo quasi terebintus• Cantate j.Ego quasi vitis• Cantate j.Ego quasi vitis• Dominus regnavit exultetBeatus venter• Cantate ij.Felix Anna cuius tres filie• Prima gignit regem• Mana mater egregia• Mana mater egregia• Speciosa facta es• Gloria patri• Mana Christi thalamum• Dominus regnavit• Jubilate• Jubilate• Vigilans et sitiens• Deus Deus

Felix locus felix ecclesia

Μ